

DOCUMENT OF THE INTER-AMERICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK

BAHAMAS

CITIZEN SECURITY AND JUSTICE PROGRAM

(BH-L1033)

PROJECT PROFILE

The project team consisting of prepared this document: Arnaldo Posadas (IFD/ICS), Team Leader; Robert Pantzer (ICS/CBH); Melissa Gonzalez and Lina Marmolejo (IFD/ICS); Sharon Miller, Syreta Roberts, Everette Sweeting (CCB/CBH); Roy Parahoo (FMP/CBA); Mario Castañeda (FMP/CBH); Nidia Hidalgo (GDI/CES); Maria Victoria Fazio (SCL/LMK); and Etoile Pinder (consultant).

Under the Access to Information Policy, this document is subject to Public Disclosure.

PROJECT PROFILE

I. BASIC INFORMATION

Project Name:	Citizen Security and Justice Program
Project Number:	BH-L1033
Project Team:	Arnaldo Posadas (IFD/ICS), Team Leader; Robert Pantzer (ICS/CBH); Melissa Gonzalez and Lina Marmolejo (IFD/ICS); Sharon Miller, Syreta Roberts, Everette Sweeting (CCB/CBH); Roy Parahoo (FMP/CBA); Mario Castañeda (FMP/CBH); Nidia Hidalgo (GDI/CES); Maria Victoria Fazio (SCL/LMK); and Etoile Pinder (consultant)
Borrower:	The Commonwealth of The Bahamas (GOBH)
Executing Agency:	Ministry of National Security (MNS)
Financing Plan:	IDB:US\$20,000,000
Safeguards:	Policies Triggered: N/A; Classification: C

II. GENERAL JUSTIFICATION AND OBJECTIVES

- 2.1 In recent years, one of the main obstacles to human and economic development in the Caribbean region has been a persistent increase in the incidence of crime and violence (C&V). The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, in its 2013 Global Study on Homicide estimates murder rates in the Caribbean at around 20 per 100,000 inhabitants. This high incidence of C&V has been attributed to many factors including the growth of organized crime (particularly arms trafficking), a stagnant economy, unemployment, and lack of opportunities for youths.
- 2.2 **The Problem:** The Commonwealth of The Bahamas has not escaped this regional trend: Data from the Royal Bahamas Police Force (RBPF) and public health sources confirm high levels of violence and criminality in the country. Disaggregated crime data show that there have been continuous increases in the most violent crimes: murder, armed robbery and rape. The murder rate, for example, has more than doubled in the last 10 years.¹ In 2013 the homicide rate was 31.5 per 100,000 people² (higher than the average homicide rate for the Caribbean region: 20 per 100,000 inhabitants).³ In 2013, an important portion of murder victims were young (37% under age 25), males (87%), killed with a firearm (82%), due to unresolved conflicts (14%), domestic violence (14%), robbery (20%) and retaliation (33%).⁴ Armed robberies have increased by 54% in the last decade (from 663 in 2004 to 1022 in 2013) and robberies have increased

¹ Unpublished data provided by the Royal Bahamas Police Force Research & Planning Unit.

² Calculated using data provided by the RBPF Research and Planning Unit and mid-year population estimates from the UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Population Division (2013).

³ UNODC – Global Study on Homicide 2013 p.32.

⁴ Unpublished data from the Royal Bahamas Police Force Research & Planning Unit.

81% (from 199 in 2004 to 361 in 2013).⁵ It is important to take into account the following key elements when analyzing C&V in the country:

- 2.3 **Youth and Young Adult Victimization.** Data from the RBPF show that most homicide victims are in the 18-25 age group (32% of murder victims in 2013; followed by the category of 26-35 year-olds with 30% of cases).⁶ Additionally, statistics provided by the Ministry of National Security (MNS) of The Bahamas, show that in 2013, 54% of the prison population (sentenced and on remand) were between the ages of 14 and 30. This evidence suggests that interventions should target both youth and young adults. Furthermore, there is indication that small gangs are becoming an increasing concern in the country. Estimates of the number of youth involved in gangs range from 6,000 to 10,000.⁷ Many suburban communities are now experiencing increased gang-related crimes and violence.⁸ Around 50 different gangs have been identified as operating in the Bahamas varying in size, structure, membership and involvement with illegal activities.
- 2.4 While crime victims are mostly men, (VAW) Violence Against Women is also a concern.⁹ Both domestic violence and rape disproportionately affect women and are highly underreported. In 2013, 14% of all homicides were related to domestic violence. Additionally, non-fatal domestic violence was responsible for 28% of all assaults reported to the police in 2010-2013 and reported rapes have increased 17% since 2004.¹⁰ Police data show the average rape rate over the last five years (2009-2013) as 28.2 per 100,000, which is above the already high Caribbean regional average.¹¹ Emergency Room data show that treated cases of rape were nearly 1.5 times higher than those registered with the police in 2013, suggesting that the problem is likely larger than what is captured by administrative data.
- 2.5 **Unemployment and At-Risk Youth.** Research and evidence, show that a wide variety of risk factors contribute to the prevalence of youth violence, one of them being lack of attachment to school and the workplace during adolescence and adulthood.¹² In The Bahamas, youth unemployment has doubled from 14.9% in 2001 to 32.3% in 2013 for job seekers aged 15 to 24 (three times larger than the

⁵ Ibid

⁶ IDB analysis of data provided by the RBPF Research and Planning Unit.

⁷ Duba, j. and Jencius M. "The Bahamas", In: Duffy, M. and Gillig, E., Teen Gangs: a global view, 2004.

⁸ Inputs for the Development of a Regional Strategy to Promote Inter-American Cooperation in Dealing with Criminal Gangs, Bahamas, CSH/GT/PD - 28/10.

⁹ Studies examining this problem in The Bahamas include: Carroll, M., Fielding, W. J., Brennen, S. & Hutcheson, S.(2011), Burnett-Garraway, C. H. (2001), Plumridge, S. J. and Fielding, W. J. (2009).

¹⁰ Burnett-Garraway (2001) - Of 313 women interviewed at random times at the Accident and Emergency Department of Princess Margaret Hospital, 40.3% were physically abused, 22.4% sexually and 39% verbally abused at some time in their lives. Of those that were comfortable disclosing abuse with health care workers, about half reported the last incident of abuse to the Police.

¹¹ Rape rate calculated using data from the RBPF's Research and Planning Unit and population data from the Bahamas Department of Statistics. Regional average calculated using rape rates from UNODC statistics.

¹² See, for example: Crime, Violence, and Development. Trends, costs, and policy options in the Caribbean, UNODC and WB, 2007.

rate of adult unemployment).¹³ Idle young people (not in employment, education, or training), are particularly vulnerable to continued labor detachment which may contribute to violent or antisocial behavior. Searching for jobs can be a discouraging process given that more than 50% of youth remain unemployed for more than a year.¹⁴ The employability of youth hinges critically on the level of education¹⁵ and skills attained to match demands from employers. Even though most students complete secondary education, only half of them actually graduate.¹⁶ Although there are not available measures of skill level of unemployed youth, most employers report difficulties in recruiting job candidates because of insufficient specific skills (66%), soft skills (24%) and numeracy skills (12%).¹⁷

2.6 Limited capacity of judicial institutions to address crime: Since 2008, The Bahamas has shown declining values for the World Governance Indicator (2012) related to the Rule of Law.¹⁸ One major concern regarding the justice system is its inefficient management systems which result in substantial backlog of cases.¹⁹ Preliminary inquiries or trials in the Supreme Court can last over a year depending on availability of witnesses, jury selection, caseloads of defense attorneys, etc.²⁰ This consequently results in a large number of inmates awaiting trial (42% in 2013 according to the International Centre for Prison Studies). In 2013, the incarceration rate in The Bahamas reached 379 per 100,000.²¹ Overcrowding has been attributed to the large number of petty criminals and to the backlog in processing at the remand center. During the period of 2005-2009 only 5.1% of murder cases resulted in convictions.²² More recently, from May to December of 2012, 69 criminal cases were heard resulting in 29 convictions, 20 not guilty verdicts and 20 cases dismissed (mostly due to mistrial or lack of

¹³ Based on data from the Labour Force Surveys from 2001 to 2013, Department of Statistics (<http://statistics.bahamas.gov.bs/news.php?cmd=view&id=111>). Further analysis within the 15-24 age group shows that unemployment is particularly high among 15-19 year old seeking jobs (42% vs. 24% for those 20-24). Overall, the unemployment rate for the country for the same year is 15.4%, according to the latest publication (November 2013).

¹⁴ <http://statistics.bahamas.gov.bs/news.php?cmd=view&id=111>.

¹⁵ Alborta, G. (2013) PSAR. Private Sector Assessment Report for the Commonwealth of The Bahamas (2013). Compete Caribbean; the World Bank Enterprises Surveys (2010) and The Coalition for Education Reform (2005) also present evidence on skills gaps in The Bahamas.

¹⁶ The fact that most students complete Secondary education but only half of them graduate (i.e. pass a final examination) is a worrying indicator of poor system performance (Education Sector note, IDB, 2013). Available data shows that 35% of 20-24 year olds from the poorest decile have not completed Secondary Education, compared to 6% of the rest of the population of that age (2006 Household Expenditures Survey).

¹⁷ Wage and Productivity Survey, IDB- DOS-2012. Fazio, MV. and E. Pinder (2014) "In pursuit of employable skills: understanding employers' demand". IDB monograph (forthcoming).

¹⁸ Indicators are composite measures covering: i) Voice and Accountability, ii) Political Stability and Absence of Violence, (iii) Government Effectiveness, iv) Regulatory Quality, v) Rule of Law, and vi) Control of Corruption.

¹⁹ Backlog reached 491 cases of 12 cabinets (Office of the Attorney General, as of June, 2014)

²⁰ Hanna 2005, p70

²¹ Compared to an average rate of incarceration worldwide of 144 ([World Prison Brief, International Centre for Prison Studies](#)).

²² Reducing Murders in The Bahamas, Chaswell A. Hanna (2011).

evidence). In 2013, 127 cases were tried resulting in 62 convictions, 54 not guilty verdicts and 25 dismissals.²³ Although, some advances have been made by the Office of the Attorney General, under the *Swift Justice* program,²⁴ it is necessary to strengthen these efforts in order to address the long backlog, the efficiency of the Court Reporting Unit,²⁵ and access to justice in high crime areas so that the work of sector institutions are better coordinated, thus making the justice system more efficient and more effective.

- 2.7 **Justification:** The GOBH has identified reduction of C&V as a priority through recent policy framework instruments (including Operation Ceasefire, Urban Renewal, Swift Justice and Safe Bahamas). The IDB will support the GOBH in the development and implementation of an evidence-based C&V strategy emphasizing prevention of risk factors affecting youth and community life, as well as institutional strengthening.
- 2.8 **Objectives:** The general objective is to contribute to the reduction of C&V in selected communities. The specific objectives are to: (i) prevent youth violence and victimization; (ii) increase employability of disadvantaged youth; and (iii) improve efficiency of the justice administration system.
- 2.9 **Component 1: Improved behavior for peaceful coexistence (US\$ 7.5 million).** This component will seek to address youth violence and to promote community mobilization and social inclusion of at-risk youth through evidence-based interventions in high-crime communities.²⁶ The program will finance: (i) violence interruption programs that will be implemented in communities affected by gang confrontations²⁷; (ii) expansion and strengthening of urban renewal centers²⁸ which will provide psychosocial (counselling) services, mentoring and positive adult role model programs, conflict resolution training (including in schools), and sports for peace training; (iii) social marketing campaigns addressing the “culture of violence” and promoting healthy, respectful relationships and gender norms; and, (vi) a women’s health survey to provide accurate data about VAW.
- 2.10 **Component 2: Employability and Employment (US\$5.0 million).** This component will seek to contribute to increase employability of youth and young adults (between the ages of 15 to 35) in selected communities with higher

²³ Unpublished data provided by the Bahamas Office of the Attorney General.

²⁴ For example, the average wait for the presentation of Voluntary Bills of Indictment (VBI) has gone from 344 days (prior to October 2013) to 116 days as of February 2014 (Unpublished data from the GAO).

²⁵ The Court Reporting Unit is responsible for transcripts and the overlapping of cases scheduled.

²⁶ Beneficiary communities will be selected based on income level, crime and violence levels and demonstrated ability of community residents to participate community mobilization activities.

²⁷ A key component of the implementation of the Operation Ceasefire is the “Violence Breakers”. These are credible individuals who can connect with those at higher risk for getting into violent activities.

²⁸ This initiative began as a pilot project in 2002 to incorporate spaces in areas of high crime where Government and community can provide a variety of services (community police, social work, healthcare, and housing).

disadvantages in entering the labor market. Activities will include: (i) life skills training, and remedial education; (ii) mentoring activities; (iii) internships or on-the-job training, (iv) job-seeking, placement support; and (v) strategies for promoting private sector participation.

- 2.11 **Component 3: Strengthening of Justice Institutions (US\$5.5 million).** The objective is to strengthen the country's institutional capacity to tackle C&V. This project will support: (i) improve case management systems; (ii) the establishment of coordination mechanisms among all institutions involved in the criminal justice sector; (iii) adoption of new procedural rules; and (iv) training and activities to sensitize judges, attorneys-at-law and prosecutors to address VAW cases.
- 2.12 The beneficiaries will be: (i) members of the target communities for Component 1 and 2; and (ii) citizens of the Bahamas for Component 3.
- 2.13 The program aligns with: (i) GCI-9 development goals;²⁹ (ii) the Sector Strategy on Institutions for Growth and Social Welfare (GN-2587-2); (iii) Operational Guidelines for Program Design and Execution in the Area of Civic Coexistence and Public Safety (GN-2535-1); (iv) citizen security priority areas of the IDB Country Strategy with Bahamas (2013-2017); and (v) the GOBH Charter for Governance, Vision 2030.
- 2.14 **Expected Results.** The program will contribute to: (i) reduce the number of youth-related crime and violence in selected communities; (ii) improve job-readiness for youth and young adults in selected communities; and (iii) increase the judicial rate of case resolution.

III. EXECUTION ISSUES AND PROGRAM RISKS

- 3.1 The EA will be the Ministry of National Security, through a Project Executing Unit. At this stage, the following potential risks include: (i) lack of coordination among government entities; (ii) insufficient data generation for effective monitoring and evaluation; and (iii) resistance in the justice sector to changes proposed by the new case management. During the analysis phase, these risks, as well as their mitigating measures, will be analyzed with stakeholders.

IV. SAFEGUARDS AND FIDUCIARY SCREENING

- 4.1 According to the results of the IDB "Safeguards Policy Filter Report", and the safeguard and Environmental Policies (OP-703), this operation is classified as Category "C", given the low impact on environmental and social issues.

V. RESOURCES AND TIMETABLE

- 5.1 It is expected that the POD distribution to QRR will take place on December 1, 2014. Approval by the Board is expected by March 18, 2015. The resources needed for project preparation are estimated to be US\$92,970. The staff time needed from project preparation will be 0.896 FTEs.

²⁹ Reducing poverty and the murder rate, lending to small and vulnerable countries, and benefitting cities.

CONFIDENTIAL

¹ The information contained in this Annex is confidential and will not be disclosed. This is in accordance with the "Deliberative Information" exception referred to in paragraph 4.1 (g) of the Access to Information Policy (GN-1831-28) at the Inter-American Development Bank.

SAFEGUARD POLICY FILTER REPORT

PROJECT DETAILS	
IDB Sector	SOCIAL INVESTMENT-CITIZEN SAFETY
Type of Operation	Investment Loan
Additional Operation Details	
Investment Checklist	Institutional Development Investment
Team Leader	Posadas, Arnaldo Enrique (ARNALDOP@iadb.org)
Project Title	Citizen Security Program in The Bahamas
Project Number	BH-L1033
Safeguard Screening Assessor(s)	Gonzalez, Melissa Maria Laura (MMGONZALEZ@iadb.org)
Assessment Date	2014-06-26

SAFEGUARD POLICY FILTER RESULTS		
Type of Operation	Loan Operation	
Safeguard Policy Items Identified (Yes)	Type of operation for which disaster risk is most likely to be low .	(B.01) Disaster Risk Management Policy– OP-704
	The Bank will make available to the public the relevant Project documents.	(B.01) Access to Information Policy– OP-102
	Does this project offer opportunities to promote gender equality or women's empowerment through its project components?	(B.01) Gender Equality Policy– OP-761
	The operation is in compliance with environmental, specific women's rights, gender, and indigenous laws and regulations of the country where the operation is being implemented (including national obligations established under ratified Multilateral Environmental Agreements).	(B.02)
	The operation (including associated facilities) is screened and classified according to their potential environmental impacts.	(B.03)
	The Bank will monitor the executing agency/borrower's compliance with all safeguard requirements stipulated in the loan agreement and project operating or credit regulations.	(B.07)
	Any part of the investment or component(s) is being co-financed.	(B.15)



	Suitable safeguard provisions for procurement of goods and services in Bank financed projects may be incorporated into project-specific loan agreements, operating regulations and bidding documents, as appropriate, to ensure environmentally responsible procurement.	(B.17)
Potential Safeguard Policy Items(?)	No potential issues identified	
Recommended Action:	Operation has triggered 1 or more Policy Directives; please refer to appropriate Directive(s). Complete Project Classification Tool. Submit Safeguard Policy Filter Report, PP (or equivalent) and Safeguard Screening Form to ESR.	
Additional Comments:		

ASSESSOR DETAILS	
Name of person who completed screening:	Gonzalez, Melissa Maria Laura (MMGONZALEZ@iadb.org)
Title:	
Date:	2014-06-26

COMMENTS
No Comments

SAFEGUARD SCREENING FORM

PROJECT DETAILS	
IDB Sector	SOCIAL INVESTMENT-CITIZEN SAFETY
Type of Operation	Investment Loan
Additional Operation Details	
Country	BAHAMAS
Project Status	
Investment Checklist	Institutional Development Investment
Team Leader	Posadas, Arnaldo Enrique (ARNALDOP@iadb.org)
Project Title	Citizen Security Program in The Bahamas
Project Number	BH-L1033
Safeguard Screening Assessor(s)	Gonzalez, Melissa Maria Laura (MMGONZALEZ@iadb.org)
Assessment Date	2014-06-26

PROJECT CLASSIFICATION SUMMARY		
Project Category: C	Override Rating:	Override Justification:
		Comments:
Conditions/ Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No environmental assessment studies or consultations are required for Category "C" operations. Some Category "C" operations may require specific safeguard or monitoring requirements (Policy Directive B.3). Where relevant, these operations will establish safeguard, or monitoring requirements to address environmental and other risks (social, disaster, cultural, health and safety etc.). The Project Team must send the PP (or equivalent) containing the Environmental and Social Strategy (the requirements for an ESS are described in the Environment Policy Guideline: Directive B.3) as well as the Safeguard Policy Filter and Safeguard Screening Form Reports. 	

SUMMARY OF IMPACTS/RISKS AND POTENTIAL SOLUTIONS	
Identified Impacts/Risks	Potential Solutions

DISASTER RISK SUMMARY	
Disaster Risk Category: Low	
Disaster/ Recommendations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No specific disaster risk management measures are required.

**ASSESSOR DETAILS**

Name of person who completed screening:	Gonzalez, Melissa Maria Laura (MMGONZALEZ@iadb.org)
Title:	
Date:	2014-06-26

COMMENTS

No Comments

Environmental and Social Strategy

- 1.1 The general objective is to contribute to the reduction of crime and violence in selected communities. The specific objectives are to: (i) to prevent youth violence and victimization; (ii) to increase labor market opportunities for disadvantaged youth; and (iii) to improve efficiency of the justice administration system.
- 1.2 According to the results of the IDB “Safeguards Policy Filter Report”, and the safeguard and Environmental Policies (OP-703), this operation is classified as Category “C”, given the low impact on environmental and social issues.

INDEX FOR COMPLETED AND PROPOSED SECTOR WORK

Theme	Description	Status	Reference
Citizen Security	1. UNDP Caribbean Human Development Report.	Nov. 2012	UNDP Human Development Report
	2. Drugs and Crime as Problems without Passports in the Caribbean .	Oct. 2011	Report on Drugs and Crime
	3. IDB'S Response to Key Challenges in Citizen Security, 1998-2012	2012	IDB's response to Citizen Security Issue - 1998-2012
	4. CARICOM Crime and Security Strategy 2013 –Securing the Region.	2013	Report on CARICOM Crime and Security Strategy 2013
	5. Documento de Marco Sectorial de Seguridad Ciudadana y Justicia	2014	Marco Sectorial Seguridad Ciudadana y Justicia
	6. UNODC International Statistics on Crime and Justice.	2010	International Statistics on Crime and Justice
	7. UNODC Global Study on Homicide 2013	2013	Global Study on Homicide 2013
	8. Citizen Security in Latin America and the Caribbean. IDB comparative advantages.	May 2013	Citizen Security in LAC - IDB Comparative Advantage
	9. Book. Teen Gangs: A Global View	2004	TBD
	10. UNODC and WB. Crime, Violence, and Development: Trends, Costs, and Policy Options in the Caribbean	2007	Crime, Violence, and Development
	11. Book Crime and Public Policy. Labor Markets and Crime	2011	Crime and Public Policy. Labor Markets and Crime
	12. Private Sector Assessment Report for the Commonwealth of The Bahamas	2013	Private Sector Assessment Report for the Commonwealth of The Bahamas

13. Reducing Murders in the Bahamas: A Strategic Plan Based on Empirical Research	2011	<u>Reducing Murders in the Bahamas: A Strategic Plan Based on Empirical Research</u>
---	------	--

CONFIDENTIAL

¹ The information contained in this Annex is confidential and will not be disclosed. This is in accordance with the "Deliberative Information" exception referred to in paragraph 4.1 (g) of the Access to Information Policy (GN-1831-28) at the Inter-American Development Bank.