

## TECHNICAL COOPERATION (TC) DOCUMENT

### I. Basic Information for TC

▪ Country/Region:	El Salvador
▪ TC Name:	Children Raised by Grandparents in the Northern Triangle: Education Policy Responses. Phase I
▪ TC Number:	ES-T1282
▪ Team Leader/Members:	Emma Näslund-Hadley, team leader, Greg Elacqua (Alternate Team Leader), Sandro Parodi, and Rafael Contreras (SCL/EDU); Samuel Berlinski (RES/RES); Florencia Lopez-Boo (SCL/SPH); Ana Sousa (LEG/SGO); and Marco Aleman (VPC/FMP).
▪ Taxonomy:	Client Support
▪ Date of TC Abstract authorization:	October 20 <sup>th</sup> 2017
▪ Beneficiary:	Ministry of Education of El Salvador
▪ Executing Agency:	The IDB, through SCL/EDU
▪ Donors providing funding:	Ordinary Capital Strategic Development Program for Social Development (SOC)
▪ IDB Funding Requested:	US\$500,000
▪ Local counterpart funding, if any:	US\$0
▪ Execution Period	14 months
▪ Disbursement period:	18 months
▪ Required start date:	12/15/2017
▪ Types of consultants:	Firms and individuals
▪ Prepared by Unit:	SCL/EDU
▪ Unit of Disbursement Responsibility:	SCL/SCL
▪ TC included in Country Strategy:	No
▪ TC included in CPD (y/n):	No
▪ Alignment to the Update to the Institutional Strategy 2010-2020:	Social inclusion and equality

### II. Objectives and Justification of the TC

2.1 Over the past several decades there has been a surge in Central American children who are raised by their grandparents. In Central America's Northern Triangle – El Salvador, Guatemala and Honduras – this tendency is particularly pronounced. Household survey data indicate that somewhere between a fifth and a quarter<sup>1</sup> of children in the 3 to 6-year age-group are raised by grandparents in the Northern Triangle; and that most of these households are skipped-generation households. The impact of skipped generation households on educational outcomes is an understudied topic in Latin America and the motives behind this phenomenon have not been systematically documented. There are several possible reasons for the large numbers of grandparent-headed households in the Northern Triangle. It is common that both

<sup>1</sup> Approximately 18% in Guatemala, 25% in El Salvador and 29% in Honduras.

parents migrate to the United States and Canada, leaving children behind with grandparents and other relatives ([Musalo et al 2015](#)). Children are also left in the care of the grandparents because of gang recruitment, incarceration or when the parents are killed in violence ([Plotner 2016](#)).

- 2.2 Contrary to three-generation households with grandchildren, parents and grandparents – that often have a positive effect on child development ([DeLeire & Kalil, 2002](#); [Pong & Chen, 2010](#)) – children in skipped-generation households more often display developmental and cognitive delays. Children raised by their grandparents in skipped-generation households have more emotional and behavioral problems ([Smith and Palmieri 2007](#); [Goodman et al 2004](#)); complete fewer years of schooling and have more learning and school related problems ([Edwards & Mumford, 2005](#); [Sun, 2003](#); [DeLeire & Kalil 2002](#)).
- 2.3 The literature highlights three groups of factors that contribute to the lower education achievement and attainment of children raised by grandparents. First, the lower socio-economic status (SES) of grandparent-headed households explains part of the lower education outcomes of these children ([Hill et al 2001](#); [Monserud & Elder 2011](#)). In the United States, children residing in skipped-generation households have a poverty rate of 25%, double the overall poverty rate for households with children ([Kreider & Fields 2005](#)). In the Northern Triangle, household data confirm that grandparent-headed households face the additional challenge of more often residing in communities characterized by poverty, drug-use and violence. Such environments are known to expose children to numerous risks that impact schooling, including malnutrition, societal stigma, and anxiety ([Margolin & Gordis 2000](#)). Second, controlling for SES, the lower education outcomes of children raised by grandparents can be attributed in part to the lack of parenting skills ([Sun 2003](#)). Third, grandparents more often lack information about the services available to fulfill their parenting role ([McCallion et al. 2000](#); [Sands & Goldberg-Glen 2000](#)); and have trouble engaging with teachers, school administrators, and school support staff ([Hayslip & Kaminski 2005](#)).
- 2.4 Despite the education challenges faced by children raised by grandparents, scant research has examined this important child development challenge ([Smith & Palmieri 2007](#)). Innovative and scalable solutions are urgently needed to assist this growing group of children and their caretakers. With respect to the specific design of such solutions, there is a debate on how the parenting practices in skipped-generation households are linked to early child development ([Dunifon 2013](#)); and what the education policy implications are of the surge in skipped-generation households ([Edwards & Mumford 2005](#)). Specifically, there has been a call for research on whether it is sufficient to assist grandparents with social coping strategies (e.g. information about access to education services and how to engage with school administrators) or whether comprehensive and more costly programs are required that combine social coping strategies with training to enhance parenting skills ([Smith, Cichy and Montoro-Rodriguez 2015](#)). Internationally, [Rozelle](#) at Stanford University has initiated research in China on the health and education outcomes of children raised by grandparents when their parents migrate to urban areas.
- 2.5 To our knowledge, our study is the first to examine parenting practices in skipped-generation households in the Latin American and Caribbean region, and analyze the effectiveness of parental training and social coping strategies on early learning outcomes in skipped-generation households. The objectives are: (i) to understand the context of skipped-generation households in the Northern Triangle; (ii) to identify innovative, effective and scalable education interventions to assist this

large group of children; and (iii) to assess the cost-effectiveness of supporting skipped-generation households with social coping strategies (Group I) vis-à-vis social coping strategy support combined with parental training (Group II). Although the focus of the operation is El Salvador, the problem of skipped generation households extends well beyond the Northern Triangle, which will make the model relevant for countries throughout the region. Examples include Venezuela where parents migrate to Brazil, Colombia and Panama; and Haiti and Peru, where parents migrate to Chile and the United States. The study and instruments that will result from the TC will be an important input in the education dialogue with these countries to help this large group of children excel in school and life. The specific objective of Phase I is to launch the pilot by: (i) conducting a census of the target community; (ii) collecting baseline information; and (iii) develop a Social Coping Strategy Model for grandparents in Groups I and II, and a Grandparent Training Model in Group II; and (iv) train community agents and educators in the use of the materials to support skipped generation households.

2.6 **IDB ECD Research.** The Bank has invested important resources in generating knowledge products to inform current debates and policies on early childhood education, including PRIDI (*Programa Regional de Indicadores de Desarrollo Infantil*) which generated child development outcomes along 4 dimensions (cognition, communication and language, socio-emotional, and motor) in nationally representative samples in Costa Rica, Nicaragua, Paraguay and Peru; as well as the Development in the Americas Report 2015 which highlights new and innovative research and data. In early childhood learning, the Bank has developed models based on an inquiry- and problem-based pedagogy to promote children's critical thinking skills, including preschool mathematics models in Belize, Paraguay, and Peru (BL-L1018, 3186/OC-BL; PE-T1232, ATN/JO-12960-PE; PR-T1092, ATN/JF-11945-PR; PR-T1095, ATN/SF-11948), and preschool science models in Belize and Paraguay (BL-L1018, 3186/OC-BL and PR-T1182, ATN/JO-15109-PR). Use of the learning models resulted in an average gain of 0.16 standard deviations (Bando et al 2018).

2.7 **Strategic Alignment.** At an institutional level, early education is a priority within the Bank's Sector Framework Document for Education and Early Childhood Development (GN-2708-5), the Strategy on Social Policy for Equity and Productivity (GN-2588-4), the Bank's Strategy with El Salvador 2015-2019 (GN-2828), and the Updated Institutional Strategy 2010-2020 (UIS) (AB-3008). The Sector Framework Document prioritizes high quality early childhood services as these not only help ensure that all students enter school ready to learn, but also help narrow the cognitive, socio-emotional, language and other developmental gaps often observed between children from rich and poor families. The Bank's country strategy with El Salvador prioritizes investment in education and childhood development, as well as the protection of children who are exposed to violent environments. The UIS prioritizes social inclusion and equity, two macro-level challenges addressed by this operation. The operation is also aligned with auxiliary indicator number 2 of the Corporate Results Framework 2016-2019 (GN-2727-6), which measures the number of "children receiving early childhood development services targeted to the poor." The operation is aligned and consistent with GN-2819-1, which guides financing of the Bank's Ordinary Capital Strategic Development Program for Social Development (SOC), including this operation. The TC objectives are also aligned with the OC-SPD for Social Development objectives to "enhance relevance, quality, and volume of IDB lending in support of social sector priorities" and "strengthen public institutions efforts to become more effective an efficient in social programming, group targeting, and project

execution”. Investment in education and child development are also prioritized in the Plan of the Alliance for Prosperity in the Northern Triangle (PAPTN), which was developed jointly by the governments of El Salvador, Guatemala and Honduras.

### III. Description of Activities/Components and Budget

- 3.1 In line with its objectives, this operation consists of three components:
- 3.2 **Component I – Development of scalable models.** Based on the call for research that contrasts the cost-effectiveness of social coping strategies with comprehensive training to enhance parenting skills (paragraph 2.4), the component will finance the development of two models for support to skipped-generation households. First, the development of a low-cost model for social coping strategy support for skipped generation household in areas of violence, including the design of the information packages. The social coping strategy model would be used in Groups I and II and include information about preschool education options in the community; schedules and hours; eligibility and enrollment processes; and information on everyday activities that can support the development of children’s early reading and mathematics skills.
- 3.3 Second, the development of a Grandparent Training Model for Group II will include face-to-face training sessions with grandparents<sup>2</sup> and children in school parent places or alternative meeting areas, in-home tutoring, as well as self-learning activities. The Grandparental Training Model will draw from parental involvement activities that have been found to be effective in improving children’s behavior and learning skills in low-income communities and a context of limited adult literacy skills.<sup>3</sup> In addition to training and coaching, the model will include self-learning materials for grandparent caregivers, as well as materials for children. To ensure scalability, the model will be low-cost and designed to build upon existing resources and structures already in place within organizations and communities.
- 3.4 **Component II – Initial pilot implementation.** The TC will finance the initial activities to pilot the two treatments developed under Component I in low-income neighborhoods in El Salvador to be selected based on the prevalence of skipped generation households (¶3.7). Component II will be implemented after the completion of the activities of components I and III. An implementing partner (civil society organization or firm) will be contracted to contract and train: (i) a cadre of local educators to help them understand the concepts and implement the Grandparent Training Model in the beneficiary households. The local educators should have teacher training and ideally teaching experience; (ii) a group of community agents to implement the social coping strategy information outreach. Beyond literacy, there is no specific education requirement for the community agents. However, the community agents should be recognized leaders in their communities. Based on work with households in other countries, it is estimated that each educator would work with 30 households; and each community agent with 50 households. To ensure sustainability, Ministry of Education specialists will participate in both sets of training.
- 3.5 The group of community agents will receive the following training: (i) an initial two-day training to train them in the use of the various materials of the Social Coping Strategy Model; and (ii) a series of workshops to model and practice the use of the materials in

---

<sup>2</sup> In households with both a grandmother and a grandfather present, an effort will be made to involve both in the program.

<sup>3</sup> Tentatively, an adaptation of the Parent Management Training interventions that have been found to be effective in various cultural settings in North America, Europe, Australia and Asia ([McMahon 2015](#)).

community outreach activities. The group of educators will receive the following training: (i) an initial introduction to the Grandparent Training Model, including sensitization of the importance of providing assistance to skipped generation households; (ii) a series of workshops with hands-on activities to become familiar with and practice the implementation of the Group II lessons; and (iii) lesson study-groups for 5-6 educators to jointly reflect on how to improve training and learning through critical analysis of their pedagogy. Originating in Japan, this strategy has become popular in many parts of the world and is being used very successfully in a series of Bank operations (PR-T1092, ATN/JF-11945-PR; PR-T1095, ATN/SF-11948; PR-T1182, ATN/JO-15109-PR; BL-L1018, 3186/OC-BL; PE-T1232, ATN/JO-12960-PE; AR-T1047, ATN/OC-11253-AR). During the lesson study, the educators get guidance to jointly plan, teach, observe teaching, and critique lessons.

- 3.6 During Phase II, which will not be financed as part of this TC (¶3.12), the group of local educators and community agents will do the outreach and training of grandparents during a one-year period.
- 3.7 **Component III – Evaluation and analysis.** The TC will finance an impact evaluation of the randomized control pilot. The first step in the impact evaluation will be a census of households in a region of El Salvador with high prevalence of skipped generation households. Based on data on remittances, violence data, and the MECOVI household survey, one or more communities will be selected that have high prevalence of skipped generation households and which allows to achieve the required sample size. These communities are expected to align well with the priority populations of the IDB (low-income communities with levels of violence that are higher than the national average). In the design of the census, the team is in contact with the National Statistics and Census Office to draw on their expertise and ensure compliance with national human subject study procedures.
- 3.8 Based on the census data, the team will randomize 2,500 households into three arms<sup>4</sup>. Skipped-generation households will be defined as grandparent(s) providing full-time care to a grand-child in the 3 to 6 age-group in absence of the parents for at least 12 months.
- 3.9 Households will be assigned to one of three possible situations. First, a control group which will receive the status-quo access to goods and services that the Salvadorian government and the social society provides for families with young children. Second, there will be a relatively low-cost treatment arm (Group I) where household will receive the Social Coping Strategy support in the form of information about what services are available for their children and what are best practices in parenting. Third, there will be a more expensive arm (Group II) where families will receive information and Grandparent Training Model using a structured curriculum. This treatment group would also receive the social coping strategy treatment in Group I.
- 3.10 The project team will place approximately 1,000 households in the low-cost intervention, 500 households in the high-cost intervention and 1,000 households in the control group. Assuming we randomly measure cognitive outcomes for one child per households we calculated minimum detectable effects for these sample sizes by setting the test size and power to the conventional values of 0.80 and 0.05 and to a

---

<sup>4</sup> We will explore the possibility of stratifying the sample by the reason the household is skipped generation (i.e., parent missing due to involvement in violent activities or working in the US) depending on the incidence and availability of this information.

10 percent non-compliance rate in the treatment group. For a random variable with mean zero and standard deviation of one, the minimum detectable effect for the low-cost treatment is 0.14 of a standard deviation and for the more expensive alternative is 0.17<sup>5</sup> of a standard deviation<sup>6</sup>. These effect sizes are in line with those achieved in similar Bank financed education operations (Bando et al 2018). Additionally, we will pick a matched sample of 250 non-skipped generation households (Group III) to study how child development outcomes differ and evolve over time in different rearing environments of non-skipped generation households.

- 3.11 As a second step, the Component will finance the collection of baseline data, using evaluation instruments that include early learning tests such as the Early Childhood Longitudinal Study (ECLS-K) kindergarten mathematics, science and reading assessments;<sup>7</sup> or the preschool version of the Early Grade Reading Assessment (EGRA) and Early Grade Math Assessment (EGMA).<sup>8</sup> In addition to cognitive measures, the evaluation will include a test of socio-emotional and executive function skills, such as ECLS-K. Additionally, the evaluation will include measures of parent-child interactions, parent attitudes and beliefs, and the effect on the labor force participation of the grand-parents.<sup>9</sup> This will be measured by recognized instruments such as the parent questionnaire of the ECLS-K; or the parent school engagement questionnaire of the 5Essentials Survey.<sup>10</sup> All instruments will be validated to ensure that they work accurately in the setting of the pilot. The third and last step is the collection of the end line data and analysis<sup>11</sup>, which will be financed under Phase II<sup>12</sup> of the operation.
- 3.12 **Budget.** The total cost of this TC is US\$500,000, financed with non-reimbursable resources from the Ordinary Capital Strategic Development Program for Social Development (SOC). The operation constitutes the first phase of the study and an additional US\$500,000 will be processed in 2019 as part of Phase II. Phase I will be executed during a period of 14 months.

---

<sup>5</sup> A sample size of 200 households in the costlier intervention has a reasonable minimum detectable effect of 0.24 of standard deviation. However, it will very difficult to identify precisely any heterogenous impacts.

<sup>6</sup> Adjustments for multiple hypothesis testing change these values only marginally.

<sup>7</sup> The ECLS-K instruments were developed by the Institute for Education Sciences and have been used in three national longitudinal surveys that examine child development, school readiness, and early school experiences in the United States.

<sup>8</sup> EGRA and EGMA were developed by the Research Triangle Institute (RTI) and have been used extensively in early grades throughout the developing world. The preschool versions, were adapted by Innovation for Poverty Action (IPA) and have been validated and used in five countries in LAC.

<sup>9</sup> By facilitating information about preschool options, the labor force participation of grandmothers could potentially be impacted.

<sup>10</sup> The 5Essentials surveys were created by the Urban Education Institute of the University of Chicago and is currently used in some 4,000 United States' schools to measure parental involvement in their children's education among other school factors.

<sup>11</sup> The analysis of the data will include a heterogeneity analysis to explore differences with respect to geographic location (urban vs. rural), income-level, child and grandparent characteristics (gender, age, education).

<sup>12</sup> The activities to be covered under Phase II of the operation include: implementation of the pilot, monitoring of the intensity of treatment, qualitative evaluation, and the evaluation endline data collection.

**Table 1. Indicative Budget**

<b>Component/Activity</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>IDB/Fund Funding</b>	<b>Total Funding</b>
<b>Component 1. Development of scalable models</b> Development of treatment activities and materials	Firms	100,000	100,000
<b>Component 2.</b> Validation and piloting of treatments I and II	Firms	200,000	200,000
<b>Component 3.</b> Evaluation	Firm and individual consultant	200,000	200,000
<b>Total:</b>		<b>500,000</b>	<b>500,000</b>

#### **IV. Executing Agency and Execution Structure**

- 4.1 This operation will be executed by the Bank’s Social Sector Department (SCL/EDU). The Bank will conduct a competitive process to identify and hire a firm<sup>13</sup> to implement the consultancies under Components I and II. The Ministry of Education has submitted a letter of support for the implementation of the project, and hopes to scale the intervention if it is found to be effective in improving the development of the beneficiaries. The Bank will be responsible for all aspects of project management, including the administration of resources, and the contracting of specialized consulting services in accordance with Bank policies and procedures. The Bank has the appropriate systems, administrative capacity and expertise in the area to be able to carry out the selection and hiring of quality consulting services.
- 4.2 The results envisioned by this operation require the sequencing and close coordination of activities undertaken of different actors – public sector, civil society, academia, and the Bank. Through its ongoing policy dialogue with the beneficiary country, civil society organizations in Central America, and the early childhood development research community, the Bank is well placed to coordinate all activities to be financed by this TC and to serve as the executing agency of this operation.
- 4.3 Responsibilities for supervision and monitoring this operation will fall to SCL/EDU, including regular meetings with counterparts and consultants, as well as supervision missions. It is estimated that the project will have a duration of 12 months for execution and 18 months for disbursements counted from the date of approval of this TC.
- 4.4 The Bank will contract the services of individual consultants, consulting firms and other services in accordance with current Bank procurement policies and procedures. Specifically, Section AM-650 of the Administrative Manual “Complementary Workforce” will be applied in the case of individual consultants, the Policy for the Selection and Contracting of Consulting Firms for Bank-Executed Operational Work (GN-2765-1) and its Operational Guidelines (OP-1155-4), for hiring consulting services of intellectual nature and the Corporate Procurement Policy (GN-2303-20) for other services.

<sup>13</sup> Under the Policy for the Selection and contracting of consulting firms for Bank Executed Operational Work (GN-2765-1) “the term consulting firm includes a wide variety of private and public entities, including but not limited to: consulting firms, engineering firms, procurement agents, inspection agents, audit firms, specialized agencies and other multinational organizations including: investment and merchant banks, universities, research institutions, government agencies and nongovernmental organizations (NGOs).”

## **V. Major Issues**

- 5.1 A pilot based on an experimental design in a context such as low-income areas in El Salvador presents logistical challenges. The commitment of the Government to the study, and the Bank's extensive experience in implementing randomized control trials in the education sector, including parental interventions such as a recent parental training pilot in Jamaica (JA-T1094, ATN/SF-9142-RG), make the team confident that the proposed design is feasible.
- 5.2 The risks associated with this operation are reduced given that its products are produced through consultancies contracted by the Bank. A key consultancy will be the identification of a competent implementation firm. Given the substantial number of qualified civil society organizations with experience from working in the Northern Triangle, the project team does not foresee any problems in the identification of an implementing firm.

## **VI. Exceptions to Bank Policy**

- 6.1 None.

## **VII. Environmental and Social Strategy**

- 7.1 The TC is not anticipated to have direct environmental or social impacts and has been classified as "C" according to the Safeguard Classification tool (see [Safeguard Policy Filter Report](#) and [Safeguard Screening Form](#)).

### **Required Annexes:**

- Annex I: [Request from the client](#)
- Annex II: [Results Matrix](#)
- Annex III: [Terms of Reference](#)
- Annex IV: [Procurement Plan](#)



CONFIDENTIAL

<sup>1</sup> The information contained in this Annex is confidential and will not be disclosed. This is in accordance with the "Deliberative Information" exception referred to in paragraph 4.1 (g) of the Access to Information Policy (GN-1831-28) at the Inter-American Development Bank.

**Results Matrix**

**Outcomes**

**Outcome:** [1 An understanding of the context of skipped-generation households in the Northern Triangle; and design of e education interventions for skipped-generation households in El Salvador.](#)

RF - Contribution

**Outputs: Annual Physical and Financial Progress**

1 Component I - Development of Scalable Models						Physical Progress			Financial Progress			Theme	Fund	Flags		
Outputs	Output Description	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Baseline Year	Means of verification	2018	2019	EOP	2018	2019	EOP					
1.1 Training products developed	Training Products Developed	Products (#)	0	2018	Training materials	P	2	0	2	P	100000	0	100000	Education	SOC	
						P(a)	2	0	2	P(a)	100000	0	100000			
						A				A						
2 Component II - Initial Pilot Implementation						Physical Progress			Financial Progress			Theme	Fund	Flags		
Outputs	Output Description	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Baseline Year	Means of verification	2018	2019	EOP	2018	2019	EOP					
2.1 Training workshops delivered	Community agents and educators trained to provide outreach and training to skipped generation households.	Workshops (#)	0	2018	Implementation report	P	0	2	2	P	200000	0	200000	Social Development	SOC	
						P(a)	0	2	2	P(a)	200000	0	200000			
						A				A						
3 Component III - Evaluation and Analysis						Physical Progress			Financial Progress			Theme	Fund	Flags		
Outputs	Output Description	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Baseline Year	Means of verification	2018	2019	EOP	2018	2019	EOP					
3.1 New databases created	Census completed of households in a Salvadorian community with high prevalence of violence.	Databases (#)	0	2017	Database	P	1	0	1	P	100000	0	100000	Social Development	SOC	
						P(a)	1	0	1	P(a)	100000	0	100000			
						A				A						
3.2 Impact evaluations designed	Baseline collected	Evaluations (#)	0	2017	Database	P	1	0	1	P	100000	0	100000	Social Development	TBD	
						P(a)	1	0	1	P(a)	100000	0	100000			
						A				A						

**Other Cost**

**Total Cost**

--

	2018	2019	Total Cost
P	\$500,000.00		\$500,000.00
P(a)	\$500,000.00		\$500,000.00
A			

CRF Indicator

Standard Output Indicator

## El Salvador

### SCL/EDU

## CONTRATACIÓN DE FIRMA PARA EL DESARROLLO DE CONTENIDOS EDUCATIVOS E IMPLEMENTACIÓN DE PILOTO (ES-T1282)

### TÉRMINOS DE REFERENCIA

#### Antecedentes

Establecido en 1959, el Banco Interamericano de Desarrollo (" BID " o " Banco") es la principal fuente de financiamiento para el desarrollo económico, social e institucional en América Latina y el Caribe. Proporciona préstamos, subvenciones, garantías, asesoramiento sobre políticas y asistencia técnica a los sectores público y privado de sus países prestatarios.

El BID va a evaluar las prácticas de crianza en hogares con saltos generacionales en el Triángulo del Norte y analizará la efectividad de las estrategias de entrenamiento parental y superación social sobre los resultados tempranos en el aprendizaje. El objetivo se divide en dos niveles: (i) comprender el contexto de los hogares con saltos generacionales en el Triángulo del Norte; y (ii) identificar intervenciones educativas efectivas para asistir a esta gran cantidad de niños. El objetivo específico es evaluar el costo efectividad de prestar apoyo a hogares con saltos generacionales con estrategias de superación social (Grupo I), en contraste con estrategias de superación social combinadas con entrenamiento parental (Grupo II). El proyecto será evaluado a través de un Ensayo Controlado Aleatorizado (ECA), contrastando cualquier cambio en el aprendizaje de los niños en los grupos de tratamiento, en comparación con: (i) una muestra combinada hogares de generación no saltados (Grupo III) para estudiar cómo los resultados de desarrollo infantil difieren y evolucionan con el tiempo en diferentes entornos de crianza de hogares de generación no saltados; y (ii) niños de un grupo de hogares de salto generacional (Grupo IV).

Durante las últimas décadas se ha presentado un aumento en la cantidad de niños que son criados por sus abuelos en la región de América Central. En el Triángulo del Norte en América Central – El Salvador, Guatemala y Honduras – esta tendencia es particularmente pronunciada. Los datos de encuestas de hogares indican que entre un quinto y un cuarto de los niños en el grupo etario de 3 a 6 años están siendo criados por sus abuelos en el Triángulo del Norte; y que la mayoría de estos hogares tienen saltos generacionales. Hay diversas razones que podrían explicar la gran cantidad de abuelos que se han convertido en cabezas de hogar en el Triángulo del Norte. Es común que ambos padres migren a Estados Unidos o Canadá, dejando a los niños con sus abuelos u otros familiares ([Musalo et al 2015](#)). Los niños también suelen ser dejados en manos de sus abuelos por el reclutamiento de las bandas, encarcelamiento o cuando los padres mueren como consecuencia de la violencia.

A diferencia de los hogares de tres generaciones con nietos, padres y abuelos – que suelen tener un efecto positivo sobre el desarrollo de los niños ([DeLeire y Kalil, 2002](#); [Pong y Chen, 2010](#)) – los niños de hogares con saltos generacionales presentan con más frecuencia retrasos en el desarrollo o en los procesos cognitivos. Los niños criados por sus abuelos en hogares con saltos generacionales tienen más problemas emocionales y de comportamiento ([Smith y Palmieri 2007](#); [Goodman et al 2004](#)); completan menos años de escolarización y tienen más problemas relacionados a la escuela y el aprendizaje ([Edwards y Mumford, 2005](#); [Sun, 2003](#); [DeLeire y Kalil 2002](#)).

A pesar de los retos educativos que enfrentan los niños criados por sus abuelos, muy pocas investigaciones han evaluado este importante reto para el desarrollo infantil ([Smith y Palmieri 2007](#)). Se necesitan con urgencia medidas innovadoras y replicables para asistir a esta creciente cantidad de niños y sus cuidadores. Con respecto al diseño específico de estas soluciones, existe un debate en cuanto a cómo las prácticas parentales en los hogares con saltos generacionales se vinculan con el desarrollo infantil temprano ([Dunifon 2013](#)); y cuáles son las implicaciones del surgimiento de hogares con saltos generacionales sobre las políticas educativas ([Edwards y Mumford 2005](#)). Específicamente, ha surgido una demanda de investigaciones sobre si es suficiente asistir a los abuelos con estrategias de superación social (p.e., información sobre el acceso a los servicios educativos y cómo involucrarse con los administradores escolares) o si se requieren programas más costosos e integrales que combinen estrategias de superación social con entrenamientos para mejorar las habilidades parentales ([Smith, Cichy y Montoro-Rodriguez 2015](#)). Internacionalmente, [Rozelle](#), en la Universidad de Stanford, ha iniciado investigaciones en China sobre los resultados educativos y salud de niños criados por abuelos cuando sus padres migran hacia áreas urbanas.

Como un primer paso en la implementación del estudio, el BID busca una firma consultora para el desarrollo de los materiales educativos y de información, así como la implementación inicial del piloto.

### **Objetivo(s) de la Consultoría**

En estrecha colaboración con el BID y el Ministerio de Educación de El Salvador, coordinar la producción de materiales y entrenar a educadores y agentes comunitarios.

### **Actividades Principales**

La firma seleccionada deberá:

- a. **Plan de Trabajo.** Presentar un plan de trabajo para el desarrollo de dos modelos que apoyarán a hogares de salto generacional. El plan de trabajo debe contemplar los materiales requeridos para las actividades en el desarrollo de dos tratamientos separados: (i) un modelo de soporte de estrategias de superación social para el Grupo I y II, incluyendo información sobre opciones de educación preescolar y actividades diarias; y (ii) un modelo de entrenamiento de abuelos para el Grupo II incluirá sesiones de entrenamiento cara a cara, tutorías en casa, además de actividades de autoaprendizaje. El modelo se fundamentará en actividades de involucramiento parental que se han encontrado efectivas para mejorar las habilidades de aprendizaje de los niños en comunidades de bajos ingresos.<sup>1</sup> El plan de trabajo debe reflejar las etapas de elaboración y validación de los materiales, y capacitación en el uso de los materiales.
- b. **Recopilación de contenidos sociales.** Recopilar contenidos para el desarrollo del modelo de soporte con estrategias de superación social, incluyendo: información sobre opciones de educación preescolar en la comunidad; horarios; elegibilidad y

---

<sup>1</sup> Por ejemplo, una adaptación de las intervenciones de Parent Management Training que se ha comprobado como efectivas en diversos entornos culturales en América del Norte, Europa, Australia y Asia ([McMahon 2015](#)).

procesos de inscripción; e información sobre actividades cotidianas que pueden apoyar el desarrollo de las habilidades tempranas de lectura y matemáticas de los niños.

- c. **Plan Maestro y Programa de Capacitación.** Desarrollar un Plan Maestro para el programa de entrenamiento de abuelos (Grupo II), incluyendo las metas semanales de aprendizaje para los abuelos. El Plan Maestro debe proveer un banco de estrategias (juegos, cuentos, canciones y otras) para cada uno de los tópicos a ser abordados durante el programa. Sobre la base del Plan Maestro, desarrollar y validar las actividades de trabajo con abuelos, niños y de capacitación de los educadores.
- d. **Identidad Gráfica.** Diseñar la identidad gráfica del programa, asegurando que sea sensible a la realidad salvadoreña y que sea sensible a temas de género y etnicidad.
- e. **Materiales Impresos.** Diseñar e imprimir los materiales impresos para el modelo de soporte de estrategias de superación social para los Grupos I y II, incluyendo información sobre: (i) la oferta de servicios para cuidado infantil y educación temprana, horarios, elegibilidad y procesos de inscripción; (ii) e información sobre actividades cotidianas que pueden apoyar el desarrollo de las habilidades tempranas de lectura y matemáticas de los niños. Diseñar e imprimir los materiales impresos para el Programa de Capacitación de Abuelos (Grupo II), incluyendo: (i) Guía para instructores; (ii) Guía para abuelos; (iii) Hojas de trabajo para niños y niñas; (iv) Libro de niños y niñas; (v) Tarjetas para lectura de lectoescritura y matemática temprana; (vi) Tarjetas tridimensionales; (vii) Tarjetas concepto. La firma debe enviar los archivos digitales al BID y el Ministerio de Educación para su revisión. Una vez incorporados los comentarios, entregar un USB con el master de los materiales en formato modificable (sin código de seguridad) a BID y el Ministerio de Educación. Una vez aprobada la versión final, imprimir y distribuir los materiales impresos a los dos grupos de tratamiento. Los materiales impresos deben ser en cartulina laminada de alta calidad. Todos los materiales deben incluir los logos del Ministerio de Educación y del BID.
- f. **Validación.** Validar los materiales en familias que no forman parte del piloto. Cada minuto de clase de validación debe ser observado para poder hacer los ajustes correspondientes en los materiales. Esta actividad se debe completar antes del inicio del tratamiento del piloto experimental y antes de imprimir los materiales.
- g. **Capacitación Ministerio de Educación.** Capacitar al Equipo Técnico Central del Ministerio de Educación en cuanto a los dos modelos de trabajo con hogares de salto generacional. Elaborar y entregar materiales teóricos de lectura para el Equipo Técnico del proyecto sobre los últimos hallazgos sobre trabajo con padres.
- h. **Género.** Asegurar que todos los materiales incorporen una fuerte dimensión de género.
- i. **Capacitación.** Contratar y formar un grupo de educadores locales para ayudarlos a comprender los conceptos e implementar el Modelo de Capacitación de Abuelos en los hogares beneficiarios del Grupo II. Contratar

y formar a un grupo de agentes de la comunidad para implementar las estrategias de superación social en los Grupos I y II. Para garantizar la sostenibilidad, los especialistas del Ministerio de Educación participarán en ambos grupos de capacitación:

- j. Informes de Seguimiento. Reportar al Banco y al Ministerio de educación acerca del desarrollo del Piloto.

### Informes / Entregables

- **Producto #1:** Plan de Trabajo y Cronograma
- **Producto #2:** Informe de seguimiento y apoyo técnico #1
- **Producto #3:** Informe de seguimiento y apoyo técnico #2
- **Producto #4:** Informe de seguimiento y apoyo técnico #3
- **Producto #5:** Informe de seguimiento y apoyo técnico #4
- Los productos de la consultoría pertenecerán al ministerio de Educación y al BID.

### Cronograma de Pagos

Entregable	% de pago
Producto #1	20%
Producto #2	20%
Producto #3	20%
Producto #4	20%
Producto #5	20%

### Calificaciones

- *Tipo de consultoría: Firma Internacional*
- *Idiomas: Español*
- *Áreas de Especialización: Amplia experiencia en el desarrollo de materiales educativos y el diseño e implementación de programas de formación.*

### Características de la Consultoría

- *Categoría y Modalidad de la Consultoría: Contractual de Productos y Servicios Externos, Suma Alzada.*
- *Duración del Contrato: 12 meses.*
- *Lugar(es) de trabajo: El Salvador.*
- *Líder de División o Coordinador: Especialista Senior en Educación, SCL/EDU*

## El Salvador

### SCL/EDU

## CONTRATACIÓN DE FIRMA PARA LA EVALUACIÓN DE IMPACTO DEL PILOTO DE APOYO A HOGARES DE SALTO GENERACIONAL (ES-T1282)

### TÉRMINOS DE REFERENCIA

#### Antecedentes

Establecido en 1959, el Banco Interamericano de Desarrollo (" BID " o " Banco") es la principal fuente de financiamiento para el desarrollo económico, social e institucional en América Latina y el Caribe. Proporciona préstamos, subvenciones, garantías, asesoramiento sobre políticas y asistencia técnica a los sectores público y privado de sus países prestatarios.

El BID va evaluar las prácticas de crianza en hogares con saltos generacionales en el Triángulo del Norte y analizará la efectividad de las estrategias de entrenamiento parental y superación social sobre los resultados tempranos en el aprendizaje. El objetivo se divide en dos niveles: (i) comprender el contexto de los hogares con saltos generacionales en el Triángulo del Norte; y (ii) identificar intervenciones educativas efectivas para asistir a esta gran cantidad de niños. El objetivo específico es evaluar el costo efectividad de prestar apoyo a hogares con saltos generacionales con estrategias de superación social (Grupo I), en contraste con estrategias de superación social combinadas con entrenamiento parental (Grupo II). El proyecto será evaluado a través de un Ensayo Controlado Aleatorizado (ECA), contrastando cualquier cambio en el aprendizaje de los niños en los grupos de tratamiento, en comparación con: (i) una muestra combinada hogares de generación no saltados (Grupo III) para estudiar cómo los resultados de desarrollo infantil difieren y evolucionan con el tiempo en diferentes entornos de crianza de hogares de generación no saltados; y (ii) niños de un grupo de hogares de salto generacional (Grupo IV).

Durante las últimas décadas se ha presentado un aumento en la cantidad de niños que son criados por sus abuelos en la región de América Central. En el Triángulo del Norte en América Central – El Salvador, Guatemala y Honduras – esta tendencia es particularmente pronunciada. Los datos de encuestas de hogares indican que entre un quinto y un cuarto de los niños en el grupo etario de 3 a 6 años están siendo criados por sus abuelos en el Triángulo del Norte; y que la mayoría de estos hogares tienen saltos generacionales. Hay diversas razones que podrían explicar la gran cantidad de abuelos que se han convertido en cabezas de hogar en el Triángulo del Norte. Es común que ambos padres migren a Estados Unidos o Canadá, dejando a los niños con sus abuelos u otros familiares ([Musalo et al 2015](#)). Los niños también suelen ser dejados en manos de sus abuelos por el reclutamiento de las bandas, encarcelamiento o cuando los padres mueren como consecuencia de la violencia.

A diferencia de los hogares de tres generaciones con nietos, padres y abuelos – que suelen tener un efecto positivo sobre el desarrollo de los niños ([DeLeire y Kalil, 2002](#); [Pong y Chen, 2010](#)) – los niños de hogares con saltos generacionales presentan con más frecuencia retrasos en el desarrollo o en los procesos cognitivos. Los niños criados por sus abuelos en hogares con saltos generacionales tienen más problemas emocionales y de comportamiento ([Smith y Palmieri 2007](#); [Goodman et al 2004](#)); completan menos años de escolarización y tienen más problemas relacionados a la escuela y el aprendizaje ([Edwards y Mumford, 2005](#); [Sun, 2003](#); [DeLeire y Kalil 2002](#)).

A pesar de los retos educativos que enfrentan los niños criados por sus abuelos, muy pocas investigaciones han evaluado este importante reto para el desarrollo infantil ([Smith y Palmieri 2007](#)). Se necesitan con urgencia medidas innovadoras y replicables para asistir a esta creciente cantidad de niños y sus cuidadores. Con respecto al diseño específico de estas soluciones, existe un debate en cuanto a cómo las prácticas parentales en los hogares con saltos generacionales se vinculan con el desarrollo infantil temprano ([Dunifon 2013](#)); y cuáles son las implicaciones del surgimiento de hogares con saltos generacionales sobre las políticas educativas ([Edwards y Mumford 2005](#)). Específicamente, ha surgido una demanda de investigaciones sobre si es suficiente asistir a los abuelos con estrategias de superación social (p.e., información sobre el acceso a los servicios educativos y cómo involucrarse con los administradores escolares) o si se requieren programas más costosos e integrales que combinen estrategias de superación social con entrenamientos para mejorar las habilidades parentales ([Smith, Cichy y Montoro-Rodriguez 2015](#)). Internacionalmente, [Rozelle](#), en la Universidad de Stanford, ha iniciado investigaciones en China sobre los resultados educativos y salud de niños criados por abuelos cuando sus padres migran hacia áreas urbanas.

Como un primer paso en la implementación del estudio, el BID busca una firma consultora para la evaluación experimental del piloto.

### **Objetivo(s) de la Consultoría**

Se requieren servicios de consultoría para llevar a cabo la evaluación de impacto del Proyecto Piloto “Niños criados por abuelos en el Triángulo del Norte: respuestas a la política de educación” en El Salvador.

### **Actividades Principales**

La firma consultora llevará a cabo las siguientes actividades:

- a. Diseño de la evaluación experimental, incluyendo el cálculo de poder y asignación aleatoria de los hogares para los 4 grupos del piloto.
- b. Basado en datos sobre remesas, violencia y la encuesta de hogares de MECOVI, seleccionar una o más comunidades que tengan una alta prevalencia de hogares de salto generacional y que permitan alcanzar el tamaño de muestra requerido (2.750 hogares).
- c. Llevar a cabo un censo de hogares en las comunidades identificadas hasta llegar a 2.750 hogares: 1.000 hogares en la intervención de bajo costo (Grupo I), 500 hogares en la intervención de alto costo (Grupo II) y 1.000 hogares en el grupo de control (Grupo IV). Además, se seleccionará una muestra combinada de 250 hogares sin salto generacional (Grupo III) para estudiar cómo los resultados de desarrollo infantil difieren y evolucionan con el tiempo en diferentes entornos de crianza de hogares sin salto generacional.
- d. El levantamiento de datos cuantitativo para la línea de base, incluyendo una prueba de aprendizaje temprano como las evaluaciones de matemáticas, ciencias y lectura en el jardín de la infancia en el Estudio Longitudinal de la Infancia Temprana (ECLS-K); o la versión para preescolar de la Evaluación de Lectura en los Primeros Grados (EGRA) y la Evaluación de Matemáticas



en los Primeros Grados (EGMA). Adicionalmente, la evaluación incluirá medidas de interacciones entre padres e hijos, así como las actitudes y creencias de los padres.

- e. Asimismo, se usará un cuestionario para abuelos (Grupos I, II y IV) y padres de familia (Grupo III) para recolectar información sobre: (a) nivel educativo de padres/tutores; (b) número de personas en el hogar; (c) ingreso del hogar; (d) tipo de trabajo del jefe de hogar; y (e) indicadores para un proxy de ingresos.
- 1.2 Para sentar la base para un posible estudio longitudinal en el futuro, la firma de evaluación tiene que tomar los siguientes datos: (i) nombres de todos los individuos debe ser registrados en columnas separadas para cada nombre con hasta 4 nombres por individuos (si aplicable) y con columnas separadas para los apellidos (nombre1, nombre2, apellido1 y apellido2); (ii) números de teléfono, contacto en medios sociales (nombres de usuario e Facebook, twitter y skype); (iii) se debe preguntar a cada participante que tan probable es que se muden de su casa actual y a que primaria y secundaria piensan que sus nietos van a ir; y (iv) al momento de la línea final (fase II), los nombres deben ser verificados contra la línea de base original para asegurar que la ortografía es consistente a través de los años.

### Informes / Entregables

- **Producto #1:** Plan de ejecución de la consultoría, incluyendo los cálculos de poder y los datos a ser recolectados para la evaluación, identificando el mecanismo a seguir, los responsables y la frecuencia y forma de presentación.
- **Producto #2:** Los informes trimestrales de progreso.
- **Producto #3:** La base de datos del censo con su informe técnico correspondiente y libro de códigos.
- **Producto #4:** La base de datos de la línea de base con su libro de códigos y el informe técnico correspondiente.
- Los productos de la consultoría pertenecerán al ministerio de Educación y al BID.

### Cronograma de Pagos

Entregable	% de pago
Producto #1	35%
Producto #2	25%
Producto #3	20%
Producto #4	20%

### Calificaciones

Tipo de consultoría: Firma Internacional

Idiomas: Español

Áreas de Especialización: Amplia experiencia en evaluaciones experimentales en el sector educativo.

### **Características de la Consultoría**

- *Categoría y Modalidad de la Consultoría:* Contractual de Productos y Servicios Externos, Suma Alzada.
- *Duración del Contrato:* 12 meses.
- *Lugar(es) de trabajo:* Consultoría Externa.
- *Líder de División o Coordinador:* Especialista Senior en Educación, SCL/EDU

PROCUREMENT PLAN FOR BANK EXECUTED OPERATIONS														
Country: El Salvador							Executing Agency: IDB				UDR: SCL/SCL			
Project number: ES-T1282							Title of Project: Children Raised by Grandparents in the Northern Triangle: Education Policy Responses. Phase I							
Period covered by the Plan: 18 months							Total Project Amount: \$ 500,000							
Component	Procurement Type (1) (2)	Service type (1) (2)	Description	Estimated contract cost (US\$)	Selection Method (2)	Type of Contract	Source of Financing and Percentage				Estimated date of the procurement notice	Estimated contract start date	Estimated contract length	Comments
							IDB/MIF		Other External Donor					
							Amount	%	Amount	%				
Component 1	A. Consulting services	Consulting Firm (GN-2765)	Development and Validation of Support Models for Skipped Generation households, including design and editing of materials	\$ 100,000	SCS	Lump Sum	\$ 140,000	100%	\$ -	0%	15-Jan-18	10-Mar-18	12 months	
Component 2	A. Consulting services	Consulting Firm (GN-2765)	Initial Pilot Implementaiton: Training of community agents and educators, including printing of training materials and logistics for training workshops.	\$ 200,000	SCS	Lump Sum	\$ 130,000	100%	\$ -	0%	15-Jan-18	10-Mar-18	12 months	
Component 3	A. Consulting services	Consulting Firm (GN-2765)	Census	\$ 100,000	SCS	Lump Sum	\$ 100,000	100%	\$ -	0%	10-Jan-18	10-Mar-18	12 months	
Component 3	A. Consulting services	Consulting Firm (GN-2765)	Baseline	\$ 70,000	SCS	Lump Sum	\$ 100,000	100%	\$ -	0%	10-Jan-18	10-Mar-18	12 months	
Component 3	A. Consulting services	Individual Consultant (AM-650)	Data Analysis	\$ 30,000	IICQ	Lump Sum	\$ 30,000	100%	\$ -	0%	25-Feb-18	25-Mar-18	6 months	
										0%				
										0%				
										0%				
										0%				
<b>Prepared by:</b>	<b>Emma Naslund-Hadley</b>		<b>TOTALS</b>	<b>\$ 500,000</b>			<b>\$ 500,000</b>	<b>100%</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>0%</b>				

(1) Grouping together of similar procurement is recommended, such as publications, travel, etc. If there are a number of similar individual contracts to be executed at different times, they can be grouped together under a single heading with an explanation in the comments column indicating the average individual amount and the period during which the contract would be executed. For example: an export promotion project that includes travel to participate in fairs would have an item called "airfare for fairs", an estimated total value od US\$5,000, and an explanation in the Comments column: "This is for approximately four different airfares to participate in fairs in the region in years X and X1".

(2) (i) **Individual consultants:** ICQ: Individual Consultant Selection Based on Qualifications; SSS: Single Source Selection. Selection process to be done in accordance with AM-650.

(2) (ii) Consulting firms: Per GN-2765-1, Consulting Firm selection methods for Bank-executed Operations are: Single Source Selection (SSS); Simplified Competitive Selection (<=250K) (SCS); Fully Competitive (>250K) (FCS); and Framework Agreement Task Order (TO). All Consulting Firm selection processes under this policy must use the electronic module in Convergence.

(2) (iii) Goods: Per GN-2765-1, par. A.2.2.c: "The procurement of goods and related services, except when such goods and related services are necessary to achieve the objectives of the Bank-executed Operational Work and are included in the consulting services contract and represent less than ten percent (10%) of the consulting services contract value."