

PUBLIC
SIMULTANEOUS DISCLOSURE

DOCUMENT OF THE INTER-AMERICAN DEVELOPMENT BANK

PARAGUAY

PUBLIC- PRIVATE PARTNERSHIPS FOR EDUCATIONAL INNOVATION IN PARAGUAY

(PR-T1180 AND PR-T1195)

TECHNICAL COOPERATION

This document was prepared by the project team consisting of: Mercedes Mateo-Berganza Diaz (EDU/CCH), Team Leader; Diana Hincapie (SCL/EDU); Juanita Caycedo (SCL/EDU); Marta Corvalan (VPC/CPR); Alberto de Egea y Mariano Perales (FMP/CPR); Guillermo Eschoyez (SGO/CBR).

PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIPS FOR EDUCATIONAL INNOVATION IN PARAGUAY

PR-T1180

US\$500,000 (KPR)

PR-T1195

US\$500,000 (SOF)

CERTIFICATION

I hereby certify that this operation was approved for financing under the Korea Poverty Reduction Fund (KPR) through a communication dated May 1, 2015 and signed by Mr. Suyeong Yu, Director of the International Bureau, Ministry of Strategy and Finance of the Republic of Korea, and resources from the Social Fund (SOF). Also, I certify that resources from said funds are available for up to **US\$1,000,000** in order to finance the activities described and budgeted in this document. This certification reserves resources for the referenced project for a period of four (4) calendar months counted from the date of eligibility from the funding source. If the project is not approved by the IDB within that period, the reserve of resources will be cancelled, except in the case a new certification is granted. The commitment and disbursement of these resources shall be made only by the Bank in US dollars. The same currency shall be used to stipulate the remuneration and payments to consultants, except in the case of local consultants working in their own borrowing member country who shall have their remuneration defined and paid in the currency of such country. No resources of the Fund shall be made available to cover amounts greater than the amount certified herein above for the implementation of this operation. Amounts greater than the certified amount, may arise from commitments on contracts denominated in a currency other than the Fund currency, resulting in currency exchange rate differences, for which the Fund is not at risk.

Sonia M. Rivera
Chief
Grants and Co-financing Management Unit
ORP/GCM

Date

APPROVAL

Approved:

Hector Salazar
Sector Manager
Social Sector
SCL/SCL

Date

TC Document

I. Basic Information for TC

▪ Country/Region:	Paraguay
▪ TC Name:	Public-Private Partnerships for Educational Innovation in Paraguay
▪ TC Number:	PR-T1180 and PR-T1195
▪ Team Leader/Members:	Mercedes Mateo-Berganza Diaz (EDU/CCH), Team Leader; Diana Hincapie (SCL/EDU); Juanita Caycedo (SCL/EDU); Marta Corvalan (VPC/CPR); Alberto de Egea y Mariano Perales (FMP/CPR); Guillermo Eschoyez (SGO/CBR).
▪ Indicate if: Operational Support, Client Support, or Research & Dissemination	Operational Support
▪ If Operational Support TC, give number and name of Operation Supported by the TC:	PR-L1097 Support for the implementation of extended school days in Paraguay
▪ Date of TC Abstract authorization:	05/05/2015
▪ Beneficiary (countries or entities which are the recipient of the technical assistance):	Republic of Paraguay, through its Ministry of Education and Culture (MEC)
▪ Executing Agency and contact name:	IDB, through the Education Division (SCL/EDU)
▪ Donors providing funding:	Korean Poverty Reduction Fund (50%) and Social Fund (50%)
▪ IDB Funding Requested:	US\$1,000,000
▪ Local counterpart funding, if any:	\$0
▪ Disbursement period:	Execution: 36 months Disbursement: 42 months
▪ Required start date:	07/2015
▪ Types of consultants (firm or individual consultants):	Firms and individual consultants
▪ Prepared by Unit:	SCL/EDU
▪ Unit of Disbursement Responsibility:	COF/CPR
▪ TC Included in Country Strategy (y/n):	No
▪ TC included in CPD (y/n):	Yes
▪ GCI-9 Sector Priority:	Social Policy for Equity and Productivity

II. Description of the Associated Loan/Guarantee

- 2.1 The overall objective of the program PR-L1097 is to improve the efficiency of the education system, supporting schools and students' learning through extended school days, and offering educational alternatives to ensure quality education with inclusion and equity. The project has the following components: (i) Component I. Development of pedagogical innovations; (ii) Component II. Strengthening the autonomy of educational institutions; (iii) Component III. Piloting and economic assessment of school transportation alternatives; (iv) Component IV. Monitoring and Evaluation. The Project Profile has already been

distributed to ERM and will be considered on June 17. The operation is expected to be approved in November 2015.

III. Objectives and Justification of the TC

- 3.1 The provision of quality educational services is one of the major challenges in the region. In contexts of scarce resources and limited institutional capacity the role of non-state providers (NGOs, community organizations, religious organizations, and the private sector) is in many cases essential to complement purely publicly provided services. Precisely to improve the education of children in the most vulnerable communities, the *Scholas Occurrentes* project emerged in Argentina with the aim of developing solutions that meet the needs of the lowest income families by utilizing innovative pedagogies that include extracurricular disciplines, such as technology, sports and the arts. The concept of *Scholas* has crossed the national level and can be replicated in other countries in the region such as Paraguay (see more information about Scholas at [SCHOLAS About Us](#)).
- 3.2 Indeed, Paraguay confronts a set of challenges related to the quality of learning, student's school trajectories, and the organization of educational institutions and administrative management of the educational system. The education sector has seen improvements in access and coverage, but, according to national and international tests¹, low levels of student learning persist. Paraguay performed below the average for Latin America country in the SERCE tests for 3rd-6th grade of elementary school (UNESCO, 2008). These differences in performance are accentuated when comparing urban and rural schools, with differences of up to 56 points in reading in 6th grade, 37 points in 3rd grade reading, 31 points in 6th grade math, or 30 points in 6th grade science (UNESCO, 2008).
- 3.3 In order to address these challenges and to push educational reform towards new horizons, in August 30, 2012, the Government of Paraguay (GOP) increased the availability of resources for education through the Law N°4.758, as part of the National Fund for Public Investment and Development (FONACIDE), which includes the "Fund for Excellence in Education and Research". Approximately 30% of these funds will be devoted to the incorporation of ICTs in education.²
- 3.4 In addition, Paraguay has launched an ambitious education agenda, whose content was developed with IDB support through Technical Cooperation PR-T1148. The agenda has

¹ Paraguay has a national system to assess students learning called SNEPE (Sistema Nacional de Evaluación del Proceso Educativo), that has been applied to students in 3rd and 9th grade of the third cycle of Basic Education, and directly managed by the Dirección General de Planificación Educativa of the Ministry of Education (MEC). In addition, Paraguay has participated in international studies such as the Literacy Assessment and Monitoring Programme (LAMP); the World Education Indicators Survey of Primary Schools (WEI-SPS); the International Civic and Citizenship Education Study (ICCS) of the International Association for the Evaluation of Education (IEA); the first, second and third waves of the Latin-American Regional Comparative and Explicative Studies (PERCE, SERCE and TERCE for its initials in Spanish). Paraguay is now going to participate in the next PISA study launch in April 2015 that will be implemented in 2016 and 2017.

² This represents approximately \$170 million dollars, for a four year period (2014-2018).

prioritized the extension of the school day as one of the key programs.³ In Early Education and Basic Education, students currently attend classes for four hours a day, five days a week, 38 weeks a year. The proposed idea is to extend the school day from four to eight hours for the first two cycles of Basic Education.⁴ Recent evidence from Colombia and Uruguay suggests that the extended school time results in positive academic and nonacademic results, particularly among students of the lowest socioeconomic households (Hincapié, 2014; Vermeersch and Cerdán-Infantes, 2008). But these improvements may be relatively modest if not accompanied by reforms in the organizational and pedagogical practices, including curriculum design and teaching staff (National Education Association, 1997; Glass, 1997; Bellei, 2006).

- 3.5 In this context, the MEC has requested that the Inter-American Development Bank engage in a Technical Cooperation (TC) to develop a model of educational services provision in vulnerable areas, focusing on curricular and pedagogical innovations that emphasize the use of new technologies in the classroom. A MoU will also be signed between Scholas, MEC and the IDB in July 2015.
- 3.6 **Objective.** The overall objective of this TC is to develop an education model with intensive use of new technologies and innovative teaching practices in those schools that will implement the extended school day program in vulnerable areas.
- 3.7 **Specific Objectives.** The specific objectives of the TC are: (i) design a system to introduce a new pedagogical model for educational service delivery; (ii) further develop a digital learning platform that supports instruction, provides educational resources, and allows managing educational networks;⁵ (iii) identify and support implementation of the new model in pilot schools with extended school days; (iv) analyze the effects of the extended school days model in learning outcomes of socio-economically disadvantaged students; and (v) disseminate the findings and lessons learned.
- 3.8 **Alignment with GCI-9.** The Ninth General Capital Increase (GCI-9) sets out five priority areas. This TC is aligned with the first priority on social policy for equity and productivity. It is aligned with the priority “raising the quality and equity of education” of the Sector Strategy on Social Policy for Equity and Productivity (GN-2588-4) and with Success Dimension 4, “all schools have adequate resources and are able to use them for learning,” of the Sector Framework Document for Education and Early Childhood Development (GN-2708-2).

³ Recent evidence from Colombia and Uruguay suggests that the longer the instructional hours, the higher the students’ learning outcomes (Hincapié 2014; Vermeersch and Cerdán-Infantes 2008). Policies to extend school days in Latin America have now gained momentum, but started as early as the 1950s and 1960s in Argentina, to be progressively expanded during the 1990s at a national scale. In 1994, with the “Ley general de educación”, Colombia established that all public schools should have full time days. Although the reform was not fully implemented, some schools shifted into longer school days. In 2015, the government sanctioned the “Jornada única Escolar”, aiming again to extend the length of the school day in its public schools. Chile was a pioneering country in the implementation of full time school days with the “Jornada Escolar Completa” launched in 1997. A year later, Uruguay implemented the program “Escuelas de Tiempo Completo”, and in 1999, Venezuela set up the programs “Simoncito” and “Escuelas Bolivarianas”. In 2006, Argentina sanctioned the “Ley de Educación Nacional”, followed by the “Política Nacional para la Ampliación de la Jornada Escolar en el Nivel Primario” in 2011. In 2007, Mexico joined in with “Programa de Escuelas de Tiempo Completo” (PETC). The Dominican Republic also implemented the “Jornada Escolar Extendida” in 2011. Finally, with the adoption of the “Plano Nacional de Educação” in 2014, Brazil established that its municipalities and states should progressively expand the number of full time schools. It is worth noticing that, in federal countries like Mexico, Brazil and Argentina, some states started implementing extended school day programs before it became a national program. For example, the Federal District (DF) and the states of Chihuahua and Nayarit, in Mexico, and the Río Negro Province in Argentina.

⁴ In principle there will be no extensions in the number of weeks.

⁵ This platform could be potentially used by all schools, and not only those benefiting from the extended school days program.

IV. Description of activities/components and budget

- 4.1 This TC is structured in five components and will finance the following activities:
- 4.2 **Component 1. Design of the management system of the new pedagogical model and non-state provision of services (US \$250,000).** The TC will finance the design of a pedagogical and management model for the provision of non-state educational services, adjusted to the Paraguayan reality. The management system will include guidance on the content and use of the extended school day and will identify pedagogical changes that should be made to maximize the additional time in the classroom (curriculum reform, use of new technologies, and recruitment and training of teachers). This component will: (i) support the creation of the Paraguayan chapter of Scholas; (ii) contribute to consolidate Scholas Global (the institution); and (iii) develop the manuals of Scholas' Art with Values and Sports with Values that will detail the protocols of intervention for both modules. The Sports with values program, has the objective of integrating sports integrating sports, value-based learning and school activities; and the Art with values program, has the objective of integrating arts, value-based learning and school activities (see more information about the three interventions at [SCHOLAS 4 lines](#)). This component will be key to ensure the successful implementation of Component 2 and Component 3.
- 4.3 **Component 2. Educational Digital Platform (US \$250,000).** The TC will finance the further development of the already existing Scholas Platform⁶ that operates as an instructional support tool, a network, and a laboratory of innovation. At the micro level, this platform supports the teachers by offering additional capabilities for curriculum planning, classroom management, and monitoring and evaluation of student performance⁷. Additionally, at the macro level, the platform is used to manage the creation of educational networks for the exchange of experiences⁸ and promoting the development of new content and educational proposals. Finally, the Platform includes ScholasLabs⁹, which functions as a space to bring new ideas and projects that can be presented by schools or individual students; the community votes for the best ideas and the Scholas team helps the owners of those ideas to transform it into a viable project and find the funding to develop it (see more information about ScholasLabs at [SCHOLASLabs](#)). This component will finance: (i) the development of education applications for cell phones; (ii) the release of Scholas Social; and (iii) to revamp the webpage design of the Platform.
- 4.4 **Component 3. Identification and implementation support of the model in pilot schools (US \$250,000).** The TC will finance: (i) diagnostic study of 1,200 public schools that will implement extended school day; (ii) the (randomized) selection of schools for receiving the pilot intervention; and (iii) the implementation of the pilot intervention in those schools. The MEC wants to strengthen 1,200 schools with an extended school day and intends to absorb an additional 2,000 satellite schools. A database will be created that includes detailed information of these schools (infrastructure, transportation, number of students per grade, distribution of students by school, teaching staff available and competency gap analysis). The intervention to be applied in pilot schools has three main components: in addition to Sports with Values and Art with Values introduced in paragraph 4.2, there is also the Scholas-Citizenship program, with the goal of promoting commitment and participation

⁶ See at <http://www.scholasoccurrentes.org/>

⁷ See at <http://scholas.education/>

⁸ See at <http://scholas.social/>

⁹ See at <http://scholaslabs.org/#/>

of young people in their schools and communities. During June-July 2015, a module of *Scholas Ciudadania* will be implemented with 250 students in vulnerable schools in the area of Asuncion; this activity will be carried out outside this TC. This first experience will be used to gather information and adapt the intervention as needed to Paraguayan schools.

- 4.5 **Component 4. Effects of the new pedagogical model in learning outcomes of children from vulnerable families (US \$240,000).**The TC will finance the design of an evaluation and data collection using diagnostic tools to identify the schools to be treated. The decision to increase the length of the school day is not trivial due to the magnitude of the investment and the opportunity cost in the context of larger social needs and scarce resources (OECD, 2011). Therefore, being clear about what kind of programs can have positive impacts and under what conditions is essential to feed the policy making process (Pires and Urzua, 2014). The extended school day program that MEC will carry out with IDB support (PR-L1097) will be evaluated using an experimental design. This TC will finance the evaluation design (evaluation questions, sample size and power calculations, evaluation instruments, data sources and strategy of analysis).
- 4.6 There is no experimental evidence in LAC about the impact of extended school day programs.¹⁰ Outside the region, research has basically focused on the impact of providing a “double-dose” of instructional time in core subject areas such as mathematics and literacy. In this type of interventions, students attend regular classes in these subjects, but receive a supplement with additional instructional time. Positive impacts have been found for double-dose algebra interventions (Nomi & Allensworth, 2010; Cortes and Goodman, 2014) and double-dose literacy interventions (Doughterty, 2013). These interventions largely focus on the lowest performing students, but there is no evidence on the impact of changes in instructional time for students across the performance or ability distribution.
- 4.7 This evaluation will analyze the impact of extending the school day on student achievement using the “double-dose” approach, therefore looking at the impact of additional instructional time on core subjects for students across the performance or ability distribution. The extended school day program in Paraguay will extend the length of the days in 4 hours. During this additional time, all students attending the school will receive an additional mathematics class and an additional language class per day. The government has selected a number of schools to receive the “extended school day program”. These schools might be systematically different from the other schools, so a comparison between these schools and other schools would not allow for a causal estimation of the impact of the program. Therefore, we will randomly assign to treatment and control groups the schools that are part of the extended school day program. We can do that because the implementation of the program will be staggered, allowing for random assignment of schools to treatment in different years. To measure student achievement, we will administer standardized test in mathematics and language to students in the treatment and

¹⁰ A majority of the existing evidence in LAC comes from quasi-experimental evaluations. Evidence from Argentina, Chile, Colombia, Uruguay, and Mexico show that longer school days have a positive effect on learning outcomes (Llach et al, 2009; Valenzuela, 2005; Garcia, 2006; Toleda-Badilla, 2008; Bellei, 2009; Arzola, 2011; Cerdan-Infantes y Vermeersch, 2007; Hincapie, 2014; Bonilla-Mejia, 2001; Cabrera Hernandez, 2015; Pires y Urzua, 2014). Evidence also suggests that there are positive effects on other education outcomes, like high school graduation rates (Llach et al., 2009), and drop-out and repetition rates (Garcia et al., 2013). In addition to educational outcomes, extending school days seems to have an effect on risk behaviors, reducing the incidence of teen pregnancy and involvement in criminal activities (Berthelon and Kruger, 2009; Pires y Urzua, 2014). Most of the literature shows larger impact for more vulnerable students and schools.

control schools before the program starts (baseline), and close to the end of the first year of implementation (follow-up).¹¹

- 4.8 **Component 5. Dissemination of findings and lessons learned (US \$10,000).** The TC will finance the materials and campaigns for the dissemination and communication of the main results and lessons learned from the components above.

Indicative Results Matrix

Indicative Results Matrix	Unit	Baseline		Year 1		Years 2/3		Expected completion date	Data source
		Value	Year	Planned	Actual	Planned	Actual		
Outcomes									
Scholas-Paraguay chapter established	#	0	2015	0		1		12/30/2016	IDBdocs-Scholas Institutional report
Schools benefit from interventions: Scholas-Ciudadanía, Arts with Values, Sports with Values	#	0	2015	0		15		12/30/2017	IDBdocs-Scholas and MEC reports
Students benefit from interventions: Scholas-Ciudadanía, Arts with Values, Sports with Values	#	0	2015	0		1000		12/30/2017	IDBdocs-Scholas and MEC reports
Schools using Scholas-Platform	#	0	2015	0		30		12/30/2018	IDBdocs-Scholas and MEC reports
Scholas interventions are applied in other countries in the region	#	0	2015	0		1		12/30/2018	IDBdocs-Report
Products									
Hiring of Scholas-Paraguay team	#	0	2015	3				12/31/2015	Consultancy report
Manuals: Arts with Values and Sports with Arts	#	0	2015			2		06/30/2017	Manuals
Education applications for cell phones	#	0	2015			2		12/31/2017	Applications available online
Scholas Social	#	0	2015			1		06/30/2017	Applications available online
Webpage revamped	#	0	2015			1		06/30/2017	Webpage available online
Diagnostic of public schools	#	0	2015			1		06/30/2016	Consultancy report
Instructors recruited	#	0	2015			15		06/30/2016	Contracts and MEC report
Scholas-Ciudadanía events	#	0	2015			2		06/30/2017	Scholas and MEC reports
Evaluation design	#	0	2015			1		01/31/2016	Consultancy Report
Publication	#	0	2015			1		12/31/2017	Publication IDB webpage

¹¹ We will probably use the national standardized test system called SNEPE (Sistema Nacional de Evaluación del Proceso Educativo).

4.9 **Budget.** TC is budgeted to total US\$1,000,000 according to the distributions highlighted in the following table:

Indicative Budget

Description	IDB		Local	TOTAL
	KPR	SOF		
Component 1. Design of the management system of the new pedagogical model and non-state provision of services	250,000			250,000
Creation of Scholas Charter in Paraguay (Project Manager, 2 Junior Assistants, Travel)*	191,500			191,500
Development of manuals	58,500			58,500
Component 2. Educational Digital Platform	250,000			250,000
Development of education applications for cell phones**	225,000			225,000
Release Scholas Social**	15,000			15,000
Webpage design**	10,000			10,000
Component 3. Identification and support the implementation of the model in pilot schools		250,000		250,000
Diagnostic of public schools (infrastructure, transportation, students, staff)		100,000		100,000
Didactic materials for module Scholas-Arts with values		30,000		30,000
Recruitment of instructors for Scholas modules Art with values and Sports with values		70,000		70,000
Scholas-Ciudadania events		50,000		50,000
Component 4. Effects of the new pedagogical model in learning outcomes of children from vulnerable families		240,000		240,000
Evaluation expert		40,000		40,000
Data collection for diagnostics		120,000		120,000
Research Assistant		80,000		80,000
Component 5. Dissemination of findings and lessons learned		10,000		10,000
Editing and publishing		10,000		10,000
TOTAL	500,000	500,000	0	1,000,000

Note: Components 1 and 2 will be funded by the Korean Poverty Reduction Fund and Components 3, 4 and 5 by the Social Fund. Components 1 and 2 will be implemented through a consultancy contract with Scholas. **These products will be transferred to the beneficiary before concluding the execution of this project. All issues regarding the intellectual property of these products will be analyzed with the Legal Department of the Bank, which will be involved during the preparation of the consultancy contract.

V. Executing agency and execution structure

5.1 **Executing Agency.** SCL/EDU will have the technical and operational responsibility for implementation, in coordination with the MEC (Ministry of Education) and *Scholas*¹². According to TC guidelines (GN-2629-1) this is justified by the fact that complying with internal requirements would delay the execution of the TC, jeopardizing achievement of its objectives¹³. The Bank, through SCL/EDU will be responsible for all aspects related to project management.

5.2 **Implementation Period.** The implementation period is 36 months and the disbursement period is 42 months.

¹² A preliminary analysis of the documentation suggests that the entity to be directly hired (Iglesia Católica Apostólica Romana/Scholas) will have accredited legal personality under the Argentinian legislation. The contracting of this entity will be subject to confirmation of its eligibility to act as a consultant under the consultancy policies of the Bank (document GN-2350-9).

¹³ In this particular case legislative approval would be required and operational input is required.

- 5.3 **Procurement.** Corporate procurement policies of the Bank (GN-2303-20) shall apply. It is proposed that Scholas, a non-profit organization be contracted as a consultant for carrying out services under Components 1 and 2.¹⁴ Scholas is a well-known educational entity¹⁵, launched by Pope Francis where technology, arts and sports are used to encourage social integration and a culture of encounter. It has vast experience in the development of programs to integrate children and youth to their communities; the support of educational projects along three lines of action: sports, arts and technology; and in the facilitation of connections between schools from all over the world, providing support and funding projects for disadvantaged schools.

VI. Monitoring and Evaluation

- 6.1 In compliance with Bank policies (see document GN-2470-2), the team will closely monitor the planned products and milestones reflected in the results matrix (see Results Matrix). Time management of deliverables: A time schedule with regard to important deliverables has been outlined above. This time schedule will be refined depending on the needs of the project and will be monitored by Scholas, MEC and the Bank. Regarding Component 1 and Component 2, Scholas will send regular progress reports to the Bank project team in order to monitor compliance with schedule and main deliverables described. In addition, the team will provide timely and detailed information of this TC's activities, products and expenses for GCM's annual reports to the donor trust funds. The team will also prepare and submit a final report including any lessons learned

VII. Major issues

- 7.1 This project will require coordination between the MEC and *Scholas* teams. This carries two main risks: institutional capacity risks and possible delays in the implementation of certain deliverables. To mitigate these risks this TC will be executed by the Bank, and will thus not require that external organizations coordinate efforts among themselves. In addition, a pre-pilot of Scholas-Ciudadania will be implemented in June-July 2015. This will allow to identify any possible execution and coordination issues, and to adapt the three Scholas modules to the reality of the country. There is an additional risk connected to the capacity of the national network of researchers to carry out rigorous, high-quality diagnostics that can inform the design and implementation of MEC program and the loan. To mitigate this risk, international experts will be hired when necessary.

VIII. Exceptions to Bank policy

- 8.1 No exceptions to Bank Policy are contemplated in this TC.

IX. Environmental and Social Strategy

- 9.1 According to Safeguard and Environmental Policies, the Classification "C" is suggested for this operation.

Required Annexes:

- Annex I: [Letter of Request](#)
- Annex II: [Terms of Reference](#)
- Annex III: [Procurement Plan](#)

¹⁴ Sole Source Selection of Scholas is appropriate for the implementation given that it is the only existing provider of this type of educational model, as stated in the Policies for the Selection and Contracting of Consultants Financed by the Bank in Section 3.10 (d) of GN-2350-9.

¹⁵ **Scholas** is partnering with a large number of international organizations, NGOs and Foundations, such as Red CONIN, Nutrition without Borders; public and private Universities; trade unions; associations and sports organizations such as FIFA, FIFPRO, COMEBOL; Fundación FC Barcelona; with technology companies such as Globant, Google, Line 64, Aula 365 and Telefónica. They have also recently signed a Collaboration Agreement with UNICEF.