

TC Document/Appendice

1. Basic Information for TC

▪ Country/Region:	REGIONAL
▪ TC Name:	Coalition for Universal Music Education in Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC)
▪ TC Number:	RG-T3391
▪ Team Leader/Members:	Mateo-Berganza Diaz, Maria Mercedes (SCL/EDU) Team Leader; Alvarez Marinelli, Horacio (SCL/EDU); Blasco, Ivana (SCL/EDU); Centeno Lappas, Monica Clara Angelica (LEG/SGO); Lee, Changha (SCL/EDU); Maragall, Juan Ernesto (SCL/EDU); Scannone Chavez, Rodolfo Andres (SCL/EDU)
▪ Taxonomy:	Client Support
▪ Operation Supported by the TC:	.
▪ Date of TC Abstract authorization:	22 Jan 2019.
▪ Beneficiary:	Colombia, Panama, Paraguay
▪ Executing Agency and contact name:	Inter-American Development Bank, Mateo-Berganza Diaz, Maria Mercedes (SCL/EDU)
▪ Donors providing funding:	Japan Special Fund(JSF)
▪ IDB Funding Requested:	US\$1,000,000.00
▪ Local counterpart funding, if any:	US\$111,200.00 (In-Kind)
▪ Disbursement period (which includes Execution period):	36 months (execution period: 30 months)
▪ Required start date:	07/15/2019
▪ Types of consultants:	Firm and Individuals
▪ Prepared by Unit:	SCL/EDU-Education
▪ Unit of Disbursement Responsibility:	SCL-Social Sector
▪ TC included in Country Strategy (y/n):	N
▪ TC included in CPD (y/n):	N
▪ Alignment to the Update to the Institutional Strategy 2010-2020:	Social inclusion and equality

2. Objectives and Justification of the TC

- 2.1. **Objective.** This TC aims to foster 21st century skills of children and youth by supporting the universalization of music education in Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC). The specific objectives of the TC are to: (i) establish a Coalition for Universal Music Education in LAC; (ii) support the implementation of pilot music education programs in Colombia, Panama, and Paraguay; (iii) assess the effects of music education on student learning and development of 21st century skills; and (iv) disseminate the results.
- 2.2. **Justification.** In the emergence of the Fourth Industrial Revolution, innovation plays a vital role in the economic growth, and policy makers around the world have revised and aligned their education systems to better prepare students with the necessary skills required in the 21st century. These skills go beyond traditional subjects such as reading and mathematics and include creativity, communication, collaboration, grit, resilience, etc. Music education has gained attention for fostering these skills and attitudes, and several studies have identified the positive impact of music education on children's creativity and socio-emotional skills (Hallam, 2010; Skoe & Kraus, 2012; Winner, Goldstein, & Vincent-Lancrin, 2013).

- 2.3. Skoe and Kraus (2012) for example found that dedicated and sustained adolescent's participation (i.e., creating, playing, making) in music for five or more hours-per-week, for two or more years, permanently changes the biology of the brain to perform better in soft skills such as communication, collaboration, and socio-emotional development. Hallam (2010) discussed the benefits of engaging in music activities in schools to improve students' socio-emotional skills and general attainment. Participating in school orchestra for example, enhances students' communication, collaboration skills and strengthens their commitment and responsibility to complete tasks. She also referred to a study in the US where 95% of parents affirmed that participation in school bands provided educational benefits to their children not found in other classes. Lastly, a study introduced in Winner et al. (2013) found that students who participate in a number of arts courses have higher educational attainment than those who took fewer or no arts courses, and the effect existed for both students from wealthy and marginalized background.
- 2.4. Also, cognitive skills such as reading (Slater et al., 2014; Winner et al., 2013) and mathematics (Mehr, Schachner, Katz, & Spelke, 2013) have been identified as additional benefits of music training (Rickard, Bambrick, & Gill, 2012; Schellenberg, 2006). Sala and Gobet (2016) explained that the core habits strengthened in the music class, such as memory, learning complex visual patterns, and focused attention, facilitate children's cognitive development and in turn, increase their academic performance. Furthermore, the National Association for Music Education (2015) demonstrated a suggestive evidence that schools with music programs had an estimated 90.2% graduation rate and 93.9% attendance rate compared to schools without music education, which average 72.9% graduation and 84.9% attendance in the United States.
- 2.5. In fact, high performing countries around the world have invested ample time on music instruction. In Finland for example, 20% of total instruction time for 9-11-year-olds is allocated to music education (OECD, 2012). England also capitalized on the potential of music education and had increased its proportion from 9% to 11% between 2001 and 2010 (OECD, 2012). A school in UK where most of their students performed poorly and came from low-income refugee families suggests an anecdotal evidence on how music can positively impact student learning. The school shifted its focus from reading/math to music and offered six hours of music per week. Six years into implementation, the school scored above the national average and was at the top 10% nationally for pupil progress in reading, writing, and math. Equally important and evident was their socio-emotional development as students became more creative and attentive through music classes and were better equipped to deal with fear, peer pressure, failure, etc.
- 2.6. Similar result was found in the School of the Arts developed by the Government of Singapore as an alternative to the test-driven schooling in Singapore (Winner et al., 2013). The school offers a 6-year program in the secondary level, and students select specific art forms to study more than 10 hours per week. They build socio-emotional skills by experimenting, expressing, communicating, and collaborating on an art piece and learn academic subjects through art. For instance, mathematical principles are taught through music, and physics principles are delivered through sculpture. Half of the students benefitted from this program were placed at the top 5% of International Baccalaureate diploma in 2013, which presents an anecdotal evidence that the program has been a great success (Winner et al., 2013).

- 2.7. **Regional Context.** Despite the benefits of music education, many countries in LAC do not include music as part of their public education system (Cajas, 2007; Hentschke, 2013). Music education is often crowded out by the subjects such as language and mathematics given the emphasis on the accountability (Abril, 2017), and policymakers are hesitant to make music education compulsory due to the limited time in the school schedule (Hentschke, 2013). However, the region is home to many successful out-of-school-time music programs, such as el Sistema in Venezuela and its numerous country-market variants (e.g., Fundación Batuta in Colombia/FOJI in Chile), wherein young people consistently participate in music training and music making. What lacks however is a clear commitment and connection of these effective out-of-school-time interventions with and in the public education system.
- 2.8. For countries that do have music in their public education system (e.g., Guatemala, Costa Rica, Ecuador, Panama, etc.) the quality of music education remains a challenge (Abril, 2017; Cajas, 2007). Music classes are often removed due to the deficit of teachers and when provided, it is often with outdated pedagogy and without proper musical instruments. In addition, there are limited resources to cover for the teacher training, and basic materials and equipment for music class (Cajas, 2007; Hentschke, 2013).
- 2.9. **Project Strategy.** The TC will build on the progress made by the Interactive Music Education Program (RG-T2512) and support the inclusion of universal music education as part of the curriculum in LAC. The previous program focused on building capacity within local institutions to promote music programs that target disadvantaged youth with online interactive music tools and in-person workshops. Developed by Berklee College of Music, Pre-University Learning Experience System¹ (PULSE) was translated into Spanish as part of the previous TC and will be utilized as the core learning portal for the current pilot to train teachers and offer music classes.
- 2.10. Countries in LAC (e.g., El Salvador, Uruguay, Paraguay, etc.) have been recently extending school hours and revising the curriculum to enhance the quality of education (Alfaro, Evans, & Holland, 2015). In Paraguay for example, the recent school-day extension provides the time and space necessary to introduce music education to the formal education system. Through the IDB Project to Support Extended School Days (PR-L1097), more than 600 primary schools will be increasing the amount of time that pupils (aged 6-11) spend in school each day from four to eight hours. The pilot music program will be delivered to the selected schools and offered during the extended hours to complement basic education.
- 2.11. The music education program will be piloted in Colombia, Panama, and Paraguay and their market justification is outlined below:
- 2.12. **Colombia:** With a strong emphasis on the arts as tools for social change, Colombia is an ideal market to further develop music education interventions and programming. Currently, the majority of music education programs are delivered by organizations outside the Ministry of Education and supported under the Ministry of Culture. Although music education is part of the Ministry of Education policy, it is not accessible to all students due to a lack of resources. Under the Decree 2120, signed November 15, 2018, it is the Ministry of Culture's mission to help develop educational programs in

¹ PULSE is an open online music learning platform developed by Berklee College of Music. It enables students to study, jam, and practice using interactive modules and engaging collection of contemporary music. The platform was translated into Spanish in 2017 as part of the regional TC, RG-T2512.

coordination with the Ministry of Education. Support for this decree provides an excellent opportunity for GMEC to serve as a strong project facilitator.

- 2.13. **Panama:** The Panama Ministry of Education Strategic Plan includes the arts as a tool for social change. Similar to the situation in Colombia, providing teacher training will help in implementing this plan and strengthening the resources necessary for social development work.
- 2.14. **Paraguay:** The government is open to outside resources that will help in providing professional development to music educators as well as the implementation of necessary research to measure the social impact of music education. This, in addition to logistical support and a strong arts community, makes Paraguay an ideal market for this project.
- 2.15. To effectively conduct the pilot program for universal music education, the TC will establish a Coalition for Universal Music Education in LAC (Hereinafter Coalition) across the members of The GRAMMY Music Education Coalition (GMEC), The Latin GRAMMY Cultural Foundation, The Latin Recording Academy, Berklee College of Music, and IDB. The pilot program is expected to collaborate with high level artists and ensure their commitment, given the privileged relationship that GRAMMY and Berklee have with top musicians around the world. The artists will have a direct involvement in the project and become role models for the most vulnerable children in the region.
- 2.16. **Country Strategy Alignment.** The TC supports and is in line with all three countries' strategies. For Colombia, the TC contributes to (i) improving the productivity and (iii) ensuring better social mobility through students' development of 21st century skills. Through music education, they will equip themselves with fundamental cognitive and transversal skills, compete strongly in the labor market, achieve social mobility, and contribute to the increased productivity of the country as a whole. The same can be applied to the country strategy of Paraguay which aims to improve (iv) human capital and living conditions. Lastly for Panama which sets (ii) strengthening the educational profile of the population as one of its country strategies, it is expected that the introduction of music education to the national curriculum will increase students' interest in learning and improve the retention rate particularly among those from the marginalized background.
- 2.17. **Institutional Strategy Alignment.** The TC is consistent with the Update to the Institutional Strategy 2010-2020 (AB-3008) and is aligned with the following development challenges: (i) social inclusion and (ii) productivity and innovation. It contributes to fostering high-quality human capital by improving access to better education offerings and highly promising sets of skills particularly for the vulnerable student population. The TC is also aligned with the cross-cutting theme of Gender Equality by equipping soft skills through music education for both boys and girls, and speaks to the theme of institutional capacity by introducing music education to the public education system, state-of-the-art pedagogy, and suggesting guidelines for a regional scale-up. It is in line with Bank's Sector Framework Document for Education and Early Childhood Development (GN-2708-5), particularly with Dimension of Success 5, given its focus on student development of soft skills and 21st century skills to prepare them for the labor market and contribute to the society.

3. Description of activities/components and budget

- 3.1. This TC will finance the following four components: (i) establish a Coalition for Universal Music Education in LAC; (ii) support the implementation of pilot music education programs in Colombia, Panama, and Paraguay; (iii) assess the effects of music education on student learning and development of 21st century skills; and (iv) disseminate the results.
- 3.2. **Component 1: Establishment of a Coalition for Universal Music Education in LAC (US\$ 0).** The Coalition for Universal Music Education will be created across The GRAMMY Music Education Coalition (GMEC), The Latin GRAMMY Cultural Foundation, The Latin Recording Academy, Berklee College of Music, and IDB. The establishment of a Coalition will take place shortly after the approval of this TC and includes the inauguration and signing ceremony. As for the division of task, the IDB (SCL/EDU) will oversee the implementation of the TC and sign a contract with GMEC to pilot the program. Latin Grammy Cultural Foundation and the Latin Recording Academy will recruit high-level artists and professional members to collaborate on the pilot program. Berklee will provide educational contents for the music class and teacher training.
- 3.3. **Component 2: Pilot Program for Universal Music Education in Colombia, Panama, and Paraguay (US\$ 600,000).** The TC will finance the design and implementation of pilot music education programs in three countries in the region. It will provide training workshops for teachers and mentors* to equip them with necessary pedagogical skills and knowledge of the digital tools to effectively deliver music lessons. Berklee's PULSE will be the primary music learning platform to train teachers/mentors and teach music in the classroom. Additional technology tools will be defined and sourced through the collaboration with the Coalition members, if necessary.
- 3.4. The pilots will be carried out in stages. During the implementation of the first two countries, the TC will finance a pilot study assessing student engagement, participation in music, and academic, social, and emotional outcomes. Teacher professional development and effectiveness will also be assessed as pilot music education programs are delivered into schools. Across three countries, approximately 4,000 students and 400 teachers, across 300 schools² will participate and benefit from the current TC. Intervention methods include best-practice models such as:
 - (i) Train-the-Trainer: Music and general classroom educators are trained in contemporary, culturally relevant music teaching techniques.
 - (ii) *Young Music Mentors: Older youth, under guidance from a trained classroom teacher, teach and create music with younger students in a school system.
 - (iii) Young Composers: Using technology and local mentors, young people in schools will create music (of any genre or style) with input from experienced

² In each country, we plan to pilot the music program roughly in 100 schools. For the selection of schools, in Colombia, we are currently in discussion to bring music education to 100 SACUDETE centers which are the acronyms of Health, Culture, Sports, Technology and Entrepreneurship in Spanish (**SA**lud, **CU**ltura, **DE**porte, **T**ecnología y **E**mprendimiento). In Panama, the Team will work with the Ministry of Education in Panama and partner with Danilo Perez Foundation to introduce music education in the selected 100 schools in Panama. In Paraguay, 100 schools will be randomly selected from 600 schools participating in the Extended School Days program (PR-L1097).

musicians and performers, including artist ambassadors from the Latin Recording Academy and Latin GRAMMY Cultural Foundation.

- 3.5. **Component 3: Impact Evaluation of the Pilot Program (US\$ 150,000).** The impact evaluation will take place in one of the three countries that participate in the pilot. To ensure that statistical inferences can be drawn, 200 schools from the country will be randomly selected and assigned into a treatment (100 schools) and control group (100 schools). The collection of baseline and data processing will take place at the beginning of the school year and application of evaluation instruments will take place during the last months of the school year. The evaluation aims to measure the effects of pilot music program on student learning (mathematical and reading skills) and the development of 21st century skills (creativity, communication, collaboration, grit, etc.) (see Section 2.2 to 2.4) and compare the results between treatment and control groups.
- 3.6. **Component 4: Dissemination and Awareness Raising on Universal Music Education (US\$ 250,000).** To support the Coalition and raise the awareness on the need for more music education in public schools, this TC will finance a concert in one of cities where the program takes place and invite the participants from all three countries, ranging from students, teachers, to Coalition members to perform. The concert will also have performances by high-level artists from Latin America, US, etc. who donated their talent to the pilot program.
- 3.7. As a dissemination strategy, each intervention will be packaged as a toolkit to bring the program to scale and share across the other country markets. At the culmination of the TC, Coalition will share a narrative case study and outcomes of the pilot program, in addition to the toolkits³ with intervention and curricular resources, including learning and teacher training materials, project exemplars, videos of the programs at work in communities, and more.

Summary of Result Matrix

	Output	Unit of Measure	Physical Progress				EOP
			2019	2020	2021	2022	
Component 1: Establishment of a Coalition for Universal Music Education in LAC	Establishment of a Coalition	Networks (#)	1	0	0	0	1
Component 2: Pilot Program for Universal Music Education in Colombia, Panama, and Paraguay	Pilot music education delivered to schools	Pilots (#)	0	0	2	1	3
Component 3: Impact evaluation of the pilot program	Impact evaluations designed	Evaluations (#)	0	1	0	0	1

³ The major part of the toolkits will be drawn from the website of PULSE which is an open source developed by Berklee with a previous TC (RG-T2512). For the additional items that are developed as part of this TC, the IDB will hold the rights of this intellectual property.

	Experimental impact evaluation (ex-ante or ex-post) performed	Evaluation Final Report (#)	0	0	1	1	2
Component 4: Dissemination and Awareness Raising on Universal Music Education	International music concert	Campaigns (#)	0	0	0	1	1
	Dissemination strategy (blogs and video)	Campaigns (#)	0	0	0	1	1
	Development of Toolkit	Tools (#)	0	0	0	1	1

3.8. The total cost of this TC will be \$ 1,111,200, of which \$ 1,000,000 will be financed by JSF and \$111,200 is in-kind local counterpart funding.

Indicative Budget

Activity/ Component	Description	IDB/Fund Funding	Counterpart Funding	Total Funding
Component 1: Establishment of a Coalition for Universal Music Education in LAC	(i) Establishment of a Coalition	-	-	\$ 0
Component 2: Pilot Program for Universal Music Education in Colombia, Panama, and Paraguay	(i) Establishment of a local partnership (ii) Teacher Training workshops	\$ 600,000	\$ 61,200	\$ 661,200
Component 3: Impact evaluation of the pilot program	(i) Impact evaluation design (ii) Impact evaluation report	\$ 150,000	-	\$ 150,000
Component 4: Dissemination and Awareness Raising on Universal Music Education	(i) International music concert (ii) Toolkit (iii) Blog and Video	\$ 250,000	\$ 50,000	\$ 300,000
Total	-	\$ 1,000,000	\$ 111,200	\$1,111,200

3.9. The TC will be supervised by the Team Leader, Mercedes Mateo, Education Lead Specialist at SCL/EDU as well as Team members, Horacio Alvarez, Senior Specialist, and Juan Maragall, Lead Specialist in Colombia. On the ground, monitoring will be carried out by coordinators from the partnering organization. During the implementation (Component 2), they will pay monthly visits to schools to keep the quality controlled and monitor pilot music classes. To assess the effect of the intervention, the Team included impact evaluation as one of the components of this TC (Component 3). The evaluation involves Randomized

Control Trial which intends to capture the effect of pilot music classes on students' cognitive (reading and math) and non-cognitive skills (creativity, collaboration, grit, etc.), and compare the results between treatment and control groups. More detailed evaluation design is provided in section 3.5.

4. Executing agency and execution structure

- 4.1. To ensure the quality execution of the initiative and in accordance with the requests from the Ministry of Education in Colombia, Panama, and Paraguay (See Annex I), TC will be executed by the IDB. According to TC guidelines (GN-2629-1), this is justified by the fact that complying with internal requirements would delay the execution of the TC, jeopardizing the achievement of its objectives⁴. All disbursements will be executed through the Bank's systems and will require approval from SCL/EDU. The Bank will directly hire GMEC⁵ to pilot the program in compliance with the Policy for the Selection and Contracting of Consulting Firms for Bank-executed Operational Work (GN-2765-1). The Bank will also contract individual consultants, other consulting firms and non-consulting services in accordance with Corporate Procurement Policy (GN-2303-20) and AM-650 Complementary Workforce. The TC will be executed over a period of 30 months and disbursed over a period of 36 months as of the date of approval.
- 4.2. GRAMMY Music Education Coalition (GMEC), The Latin Recording Academy (LRA), The Latin GRAMMY Cultural Foundation (LGCF), Berklee College of Music, and IDB will be the partners of the Coalition and help implement current TC (See Annex). GMEC is currently leading a movement toward universal music education in the US and collaborates with various levels of the government to offer quality music education in the public schools. LRA represents the music professionals in Spanish- or Portuguese-speaking communities and stages the Annual Latin GRAMMY Awards. LGCF, through scholarships, fellowships, grants, and education programs, furthers international awareness of Latin music and its makers. Lastly, Berklee is the preeminent institute of contemporary music and the performing arts, offering undergraduate and graduate degree programs at its campuses in Boston and Valencia, Spain, and through its award-winning distance learning program, Berklee Online.

5. Major issues

- 5.1. For a successful implementation of the pilot program, Coalition will need to work closely with the Ministries of Education and Culture in three countries. From country to country, these ministries operate with different policies and procedure; it will be important to assess the environment in each market and adjust proposed interventions accordingly.
- 5.2. To mitigate the potential risk of underutilization of the knowledge and skills acquired from this intervention, the following two strategies will be applied: (i) at the systemic

⁴ In the case of Paraguay for example, legislative approval as well as the operational input is required.

⁵ This will be a Single Source Procurement because by contracting GMEC, the Bank and the project can benefit from the highest-quality project implementation. GMEC holds long years of experience promoting and making music education universal in public schools in the US, which is the critical expertise required for the successful execution of our TC. GMEC's strong alliance with the high-level musicians in LAC and across the globe, also serves as a great advantage for our bank and for our project. Given the nature of our project, introducing universal music education, which is new to the region, the bank can take advantage of the great relationship that GMEC has built over the years with the high-level musicians and international music NGOs, engage in a fluid communication, and enjoy a smooth and effective project implementation.

level, strong links will be created between this TC and current initiative (e.g., extended school day in Paraguay), developing detailed action plans for the government to continue promoting universal music education; (ii) the bottom-up approach will ensure strong engagement of all beneficiaries (children, families and teachers/school directors) of the program. Teachers who received training will take active roles in the pilot classes to apply and strengthen their knowledge and skills and will also be encouraged to transfer and share their knowledge and experiences with other professionals.

6. Exceptions to Bank policy

6.1. There are no exceptions to any Bank policy.

7. Environmental and Social Strategy

7.1. The TC is not anticipated to have direct environmental or social impacts and has been classified as “C” according to the Safeguard Classification tool (see [Safeguard Policy Filter Report](#) and [Safeguard Screening Form](#)).

Required Annexes:

- [Request from the Client - RG-T3391](#)
- [Results Matrix - RG-T3391](#)
- [Terms of Reference - RG-T3391](#)
- [Procurement Plan - RG-T3391](#)